

HOME DEPT. PROCEEDINGS, APRIL 1877.

Translation of European works into the Vernacular languages of India for the purposes of education.

No. 1326, dated Calcutta, the 31st March 1873.

Nos.
53 to 61.

From—C. BERNARD, Esq., Offg. Secretary to the Government of Bengal,
General Department.

No. 53.

To—The Secretary to the Government of India.

WITH reference to your letter No. 476, dated 14th December last, I am directed to submit a copy of the correspondence noted on the margin on the subject of the translation of English standard books into the Vernacular languages of India for the purposes of education.

- (1.) Letter from the Calcutta School Book Society, No. 1176, dated 24th February 1873.
- (2.) Letter from the Behar Scientific Society, No. 1, dated 8th March 1873.
- (3.) Letter from the Director of Public Instruction, No. 1047, dated 17th March 1873.

2. The Lieutenant-Governor generally concurs in the remarks of the Director of Public Instruction as to the necessity of revising the list of books for translation prepared by the Allyghur Institute, and as to considering separately the question of securing translations of particular books as occasion requires.

3. The enclosed copy of instructions to the Director will shew the steps which the Lieutenant-Governor proposes to take on the matter.

No. 1176, dated Calcutta, the 24th February 1873.

No. 54.

From—H. ANDREWS, Esq., Secretary to the Calcutta School Book Society.

To—The Offg. Secretary to the Government of Bengal, General Dept.

I HAVE the honour to acknowledge the receipt of your docket No. 4636, dated the 27th December 1872, and to state that a correspondence on the subject of translations into the principal Vernacular languages of India of English scientific works for the Education Department took place in 1870-71, and the Committee then addressed the Secretary to the Government of India in the Home Department in a letter No. 1281, dated the 16th March 1871, explaining the little that had been done to this end. They desire me to state that they have occasionally undertaken special works for the use of schools, but they are not at present in a position to offer any practical suggestions on the general question. They will, however, be prepared to act in concert with the Education Department with whom it rests to prescribe the books for the standard courses.

No. 1, dated the 8th March 1873.

No. 55.

From—H. W. GORDON, Esq., Secretary, Behar Scientific Society.

To—The Assistant Secretary to the Government of Bengal, General Department.

I AM directed by the Behar Scientific Society to acknowledge the receipt of your letter No. 4637, dated 27th December 1872, and its reminder dated the 15th February last, requesting an expression of opinion as to the best means of inducing persons to translate certain educational works contained in an extract from the *Allyghur Institute Gazette* dated 14th October 1870, and in reply I am to observe as follows.

2. The Society from the time of its establishment has directed its efforts to the translation into Hindustani of certain standard works with the view to their

HOME DEPT. PROCEEDINGS, APRIL 1877.

being made use of for educational purposes. The works already translated by the Society are given in the appended list. The Society, however, has to remark with great regret that these works have, so to speak, fallen still-born from the press, for not a single copy has been disposed of, and not a single copy has been made use of by the Educational Department in the Province of Behar.

No. 55.

3. The Society had ventured to hope, when it undertook to translate these works, that many of them would have been admitted as text books into the Vernacular and normal schools in Behar; but although list of these books have been submitted to the educational authorities, they have apparently not met with their approval.

4. The Society, therefore, feels that unless some remedy be derived whereby some practical effect may follow its labours, it is next to useless to continue to translate and accumulate any more of such books.

5. At present the Society finds that it is creating a supply where there is no demand, and that while its aims have been to translate into the Vernacular books which might be practically useful for educational purposes, yet up to the present time no practical results have been secured. The members, therefore, cannot but think that no advantage or benefit can be derived from their past and future exertions, unless they can rely on the Educational Department, viewing their translations with a favourable eye, and allowing them, as far as practicable, to be used as text books in the Vernacular and normal schools in Behar.

6. The Society does not think that His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor will regard this as an unreasonable request, seeing that many of the books which have already been translated are on standard subjects (such as Barnard Smith's Arithmetic and Algebra, Todhunter's Euclid, Mechanics, &c.) which are, or will be, taught in all Vernacular and normal schools, and which form a portion of the Vernacular scholarship test examinations.

7. The Society does not feel itself bound to adhere to the list published in the *Allyghur Gazette*; on the contrary, it is ready and willing to translate works of a simple character so as to meet the wants of the Educational Department in Behar: provided it have some guarantee that these works, when translated, will be made use of, and not be left unnoticed and untouched on the shelves of the Society's Library.

8. Hitherto the Society has confined its attentions to translations into Hindustani. But seeing the demand for Hindi that is now springing up in this Province, the Society will be happy to render into Hindi the books already translated into Hindustani, and in future to supply translations in Hindi as well as in Hindustani so as to meet the want of Hindi books which the Society believes at present exists in the Educational Department to a very great extent.

9. As far therefore as the Society is concerned, it is very desirous to carry on the work it has begun. The members wish to regulate the supply according to the demand, and they only solicit that the educational authorities will so far encourage and co-operate with them as to purchase and use their books as far as practicable, and they feel assured that His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor, considering the circumstances now represented, will not refuse to grant them the assistance and encouragement they crave.

10. In conclusion, the Society desires me to suggest that the offer of rewards for good translations of useful books, especially in the Hindi language, would undoubtedly encourage private individuals, not only to try their hands at translating, but to devote their time and attention to the cultivation of a language which cannot at present lay claim to the possession of an extensive literature. The Society has observed with much pleasure the great interest His Honor takes in stimulating the improvement of the Vernacular language of Behar, and it feels confident that any further encouragement His Honor may be pleased to afford by the offer of prizes and rewards will not prove barren of results.

Index
No.

EDUCATION.

Progs.
No.

HOME DEPT. PROCEEDINGS, APRIL 1877.

List of Books translated or compiled under the patronage of the Behar Scientific Society. No. 55.

Number.	Names of books.	Science.	Name of translator or compiler.
1	Todhunter's Elements, Euclid ...	Mathematics	By M. Zokaullah.
2	Ditto Algebra ...	Ditto ...	Ditto.
3	Barnard Smith's Arithmetic ...	Ditto ...	Ditto.
4	Todhunter's Algebra for Colleges and Schools	Ditto ...	Ditto.
5	Barnard Smith's Algebra ...	Ditto ...	Ditto.
6	Todhunter's Mensuration ...	Ditto ...	Ditto.
7	Manual of Arithmetic, by S. Haughton ...	Ditto ...	Ditto.
8	Ditto of Plane Trigonometry, by S. Haughton	Ditto ...	Ditto.
9	Todhunter's ditto ...	Ditto ...	Ditto.
10	Ditto Spherical ditto ...	Ditto ...	Ditto.
11	An Elementary Treatise on the Theory of Equation by Todhunter.	Ditto ...	Ditto.
12	Plane Co-ordinate Geometry as applied to the Straight Line and the Conic Sections, by Todhunter.	Ditto ...	Ditto.
13	A Treatise on the Integral Calculus, by Todhunter.	Ditto ...	Ditto.
14	A Treatise on the Differential Calculus, by Todhunter.	Ditto ...	Ditto.
15	Manual of Arithmetic, by S. Haughton.		
16	Ditto of Algebra, by ditto ...	Ditto ...	Ditto.
17	Ditto of Euclid, by ditto ...	Ditto ...	Ditto.
18	Todhunter's Integral Calculus ...	Ditto ...	Ditto.
19	Works on Roads and Calverts ...	Engineering	By M. Syad Sadiqally, Surveying Master of Mozufferpur Government Zila School.
20	Plane Trigonometry ...	Mathematics	Ditto.
21	Construction, Building, Engineering ...	Ditto ...	Ditto.
22	Todd's Student Manual	By M. Abdul Rohim, Deputy Inspector, S. F.
23	Gulistan, Chapter VIII., in Hindi and Hindustani.	Literature...	Ditto.
24	Treatise on Female Education ...	Ditto ...	Ditto.

No. 1047, dated Calcutta, the 17th March 1873.

No. 56.

From—W. S. ATKINSON, Esq., Director of Public Instruction, Calcutta.

To—The Secretary to the Government of Bengal, General Dept.

In reply to your No. 4635, dated the 27th December, I have the honour to submit my report on the communication from the Government of India No. 476, dated the 14th December last, relating to a scheme for the translation of English standard works into the Vernacular languages of India as a means for the advancement of Native education.

HOME DEPT. PROCEEDINGS, APRIL 1877.

2. The Government of India has sent down a list of works proposed for translation compiled by an Association known as the Alighur Institute, and I shall venture, in the first place, to submit a few remarks on the character of this list with a view to a revision of it.

No. 56.

3. It appears to me and to others whom I have consulted that the list is of very impracticable length, and at the same time very incomplete, while its arrangement betrays great ignorance of the contents of many of the books.

4. Thus the mathematical list is enormously long, and includes works of such difficulty that they are not required even for the honour degree in mathematics, as, for instance, Routh's Rigid Dynamics, which moreover assumes a good knowledge of solid geometry, though there is not a single treatise on solid geometry in the list; while in the elementary subjects, in addition to Todhunter's books, we have Haughton's books, which cover the same ground. Haughton is generally considered inferior to Todhunter, but at any rate both series are not wanted. Hamlin Smith's series, which is not given, might also be weighed against Haughton's and even Todhunter's.

Then as to the classification of the books. Parkinson's Optics is placed under "Physical Optics", whereas it treats of geometrical optics exclusively; and while Parkinson's Mechanics is placed under the head of "Mechanics", Todhunter's Statics appears under "Pure and Applied Mathematics", the fact being that both books treat of the same subject in the same way—Parkinson's being the more elementary of the two. This mathematical list requires to be carefully considered and reduced by a committee of competent mathematical men. It should be confined at first to a very limited number of elementary treatises for which a large circulation might be expected, such as—

Barnard Smith's Arithmetic.

Todhunter's Algebra.

Todhunter's Trigonometry.

Todhunter's Mensuration.

&c., &c.

When these have been translated, a further list of more advanced works might be put out, if it should then be thought desirable to push on the scheme.

5. The Political Economy list is remarkable for the absence of most of the great names in the science,—Adam Smith, McCulloch, Malthus, Ricardo, J. S. Mill;—while it includes Macleod, who is regarded as an utter heretic by all orthodox Politico-Economists; Bastiat, whose Harmonies contains a French sentimental tirade about social questions; and DeTocqueville, who has no Political Economy at all.

This list, like the mathematical, and indeed all the other lists, requires reduction and simplification.

We might commence with—

Adam Smith, part of the Wealth of Nations;

Fawcett's Manual;

Senior's Treatise;

and when the list wants extending, we might add—

Malthus on Population;

McCulloch's Political Economy;

Ricardo on Rent and Taxation;

J. S. Mill's Political Economy;

and perhaps Babbage's book on the Economy of Labour in Machinery.

6. Then again in the history list, such books as Grote's and Thirlwall's Histories of Greece seem quite out of place. India is not ready for translations of such works, and will not be for another century, when these histories will probably not be wanted.

7. The entire list might probably be reduced with advantage to less than a third of its present dimensions, and the work should be done by competent committees taking up particular groups of subjects.

8. When a suitable list has been settled, there still remains the perplexing problem of Vernacular terminology. We want a uniform plan for dealing with scientific terms and phraseology, and for the formation, if possible, of a condensed

HOME DEPT. PROCEEDINGS, APRIL 1877.

scientific style for purely scientific treatises. The scientific compilations which are rapidly issuing from the press in Bengali are, with few exceptions, thoroughly unsystematic, loose in science, slipshod in style, and variously barbarous in terminology. (What is required is a carefully-considered code of canons regulating systems of nomenclature for the various sciences in the Vernaculars, adapted to the whole of India, and issued by competent authority with copious glossaries.)

No. 56.

It has occurred to me that the Calcutta University might perhaps be moved to take up this subject, at any rate for the Sanskritic languages, but whatever rules may be finally agreed upon should be issued authoritatively by the Governor General in Council.

9. When these preliminaries have been settled, fixed money prizes might perhaps be offered by Government from time to time for approved translations of particular books, or groups of books; but for works of a purely scientific character in advance of elementary treatises, if even moderate excellence is aimed at, I believe it will be necessary to employ first class Native scholars under thoroughly competent European superintendence.

Speaking for Lower Bengal, however, I very much doubt the expediency of spending the funds that would be necessary to secure translations of this class, because in these Provinces every one at all likely to take up the higher branches of science is familiar with the English language, and will naturally prefer to read such works in their original form rather than in translations.

As regards elementary treatises, if they are on subjects that are taught in Vernacular schools no Government payment will be required, as an approved school book will be sure of a large circulation, and will be abundantly remunerative to the translator.

10. My suggestions then come to this: That the list of books for translation should be carefully revised, that canons should be laid down for scientific terminology in the Vernaculars, and that after these preliminaries have been settled, the question of securing trustworthy translations should be considered separately for particular works, or classes of works, as the need for them may from time to time become apparent.

No. 1324, dated Calcutta, the 31st March 1873.

From—C. BERNARD, Esq., Offg. Secretary to the Govt. of Bengal, General Department.

To—The Director of Public Instruction, Calcutta.

I AM directed to acknowledge the receipt of your letter No. 1047, dated 17th March 1873, regarding the translation of English standard works into the Vernacular languages of India for educational purposes.

2. In reply I am to say that as sufficient encouragement is provided for the translation of every good school book into Bengali, and, moreover, as a Bengali school book when it is once adopted and comes on the School Book Society's list becomes valuable property, the Lieutenant-Governor does not think that any special action is required for Bengal, unless it be a reward for a good translation of Geikie's or any other selected text book on physical geography.

3. But for Behar, Orissa and Assam the case is quite different. In Orissa there is a School Book Committee who were allowed a grant of Rs. 3,000 to spend in procuring translations of standard school books into Uriya. The Lieutenant-Governor thinks that we should have similar divisional committees for the purpose of encouraging Hindi translations in Behar, and Assamese translations in Assam, and that a grant may be allowed to such committees.

4. I am to request that you will be good enough, in communication with Mr. Woodrow and any two Native educationalists whom you may name, to draw up a short preliminary list of, say, not more than 40 elementary school books, of which good translations are required. The divisional committees would then offer considerable rewards for approved translations of four or five of these books at a time with conditions as to the maximum price at which the book, if adopted, should be sold in the division.

5. With reference to the annexed copy of a letter* from the Behar Scientific Society, I am to request that you will be so good as to consider the remarks as to their books not having been adopted. The Lieutenant-Governor thinks that if the Society are willing to translate useful elementary school books, its efforts into Hindi may certainly be encouraged.

No. 56.

* No. 1, dated 8th March 1873.

6. In Behar and Assam divisional committees should now be appointed to consider and decide upon all new school books submitted for their inspection. If the committee decided in favour of any book, they might award a prize to its translator or author, and would bring the book on to the list of Government school books. I am to ask you to consult with the Commissioner and to propose the names of suitable members for such committees.

No. 379 A, dated Naini Tal, the 9th June 1873.

No. 57.

From—A. COLVIN, Esq., Offg. Secretary to the Government of the North-Western Provinces.

To—The Secretary to the Government of India.

I AM directed to acknowledge the receipt of your letter No. 477, dated the 14th December last, regarding the translation of English standard works into the Vernacular languages for educational purposes.

2. In reply I am to forward, for submission to His Excellency the Viceroy and Governor General in Council, papers as noted in the margin* containing the opinions of certain officers who have been consulted, and to refer to a comprehensive memorandum† on the subject dated 19th April 1870, by Mr. Kempson, which is also enclosed for facility of reference.

* Letter No. 84 G, dated 22nd April 1873, with enclosures, from Director of Public Instruction, N. W. P.

† See letter from this Government No. 625, dated 24th May 1870.

3. A perusal of the present correspondence will show that by general consent, though by differing trains of reasoning, the proposal for any general scheme of translating English works into the Vernacular is discouraged. The Lieutenant-Governor's own view is also unfavourable to it. In forwarding the despatch of the Supreme Government under acknowledgment to the Director of Public Instruction for the North-Western Provinces, Mr. Elliott wrote: "I am to state that the Lieutenant-Governor's own opinion is that translations made to order prove, as a rule, failures. The 'penny-a-line' system pursued by the Delhi Society before the mutiny has left no work of merit and use behind it. Translations, or rather adapted versions of literary works, are not to be obtained in this way. Perhaps purely scientific treatises may be held to some degree an exception, and rewards might be offered for such as the Government of India might wish to be available in the schools and colleges in these Provinces."

4. My predecessor had the honour of submitting the opinions of Sir William Muir on this question in his despatch of December 1868 (copy enclosed), and the Lieutenant-Governor's views as there stated have only been confirmed by the experience of the last five years.

5. Little is to be hoped from the offer of rewards for the translation of certain specified works. The experiment has often been tried, and (excepting in a very few cases of tales or allegories, as the Pilgrim's Progress, Sandford and Merton and Robinson Crusoe) has failed. For a notice of the Delhi translations, I am to refer to the report of the Committee assembled under the orders of the then Lieutenant-Governor, Mr. J. R. Colvin, as quoted in the 15th para. of the despatch above referred to. None of these translations "ever came into circulation, or survived the mutiny".

6. Sir William Muir can do little more than reiterate the view expressed in para. 9 of that despatch: "The Lieutenant-Governor

believes that a Vernacular literature must be of spontaneous growth. It cannot be created to order. (To be popular, it must be indigenous. The author must select his own ground, and must approach it from his own point of view : only thus is it to be expected that he will produce a work Native in its dress and suitable in its modes of thought. Impressed with this conviction, the Lieutenant-Governor, in the offer of rewards, left the choice of subjects and mode of treatment absolutely in the author's hands."

No. 57.

7. Again, few works (excepting perhaps some concerning the exact sciences) will bear to be baldly translated. To adapt them to this country they require to be re-cast and thrown into the mould of Native thought. And it is to the rearing up of a class of students qualified for such a task, or better still for original composition, that our efforts should be directed; in other words, to lead those (as para. 12 of the above-quoted despatch says) "who by a fair English education have acquired precious stores of European knowledge to prosecute the Oriental studies which would qualify and fit them for communicating those treasures to their fellow-countrymen in an elegant Vernacular style, and in conformity with Native modes of thought and illustration".

8. The University fails to produce, in the measure it otherwise might, men of this stamp, because it insists upon too prolonged a study and too high a standard of English, which, as a rule, is incompatible with high proficiency in Oriental literature; while such proficiency again is, generally speaking, indispensable for power in Vernacular authorship. The same view is urged in my predecessor's despatch No. 2245, dated 6th May 1869. Again, as shown by Mr. Kempson, no encouragement is at present held out by the offer of honours for the mastery of the Oriental system of philosophy, as exhibited either in Arabic, Persian or Sanskrit. It is only by scholars well versed in these as well as in European literature that the power of enriching the Vernacular from this source is to be hoped for. Mr. Kempson writes: "No translator but one who had studied both the Western and Oriental systems would be competent to select the terms. Thought and inquiry in this direction will be best advanced by popularizing the Oriental philosophies in the first instance; and I think it is a matter of regret that the Calcutta University demands an acquaintance with Reid, Abercrombie and Hamilton, rather than with Abu Sina, Nasiruddin Tusi, and other Oriental thinkers, for the middle examinations in Arts." I am also to refer the Supreme Government to the correspondence on the subject, printed at pages 166 to 221 in the volume of Proceedings of this Government in the General Department for the month of November 1870, and to the following extract from a letter addressed by this Government to the Registrar of the Calcutta University, dated 27th June 1870, No. 2725 A: "The Lieutenant-Governor also concurs with the Director of Public Instruction in holding that after a certain point in the University examination the student should be allowed to take up for honours branches of Oriental literature bearing on logic and ethics. The study of these would be an equal test of mental activity and power with that of European authors; while it would familiarize the student with the modes of Oriental thought and argument, improve his style, and enrich his vocabulary. Honours might even be given for profound acquaintance with certain of the Oriental historians—a class which Mr. Kempson thinks we should avoid. The Persian historians of India might be studied with advantage; and although, in some of its aspects, Arabian history does not furnish the political lessons it may be most expedient to put before the Mussulman student, yet

the objection may be over-strained. There are chapters from the pen of Arabic historians than which few others (His Honor is disposed to think) are more suitable for the Indian student. Those, for example, which tell of the conquest of Sicily and of Spain by the Moors, and of their eventual expulsion, and which have engaged the labours of such scholars as Amari and Dozy, would have the special benefit of showing at what points the history of the East touches that of the West; and the study might even lead the scholar on to a wider application of his critical canons, and to test by them the vast confused mass of myth, fact, fable and fiction, which he is at present taught to regard as history. Sir William Muir can think of no object more worthy of the labours of an Indian university than thus to rouse the people from their dreamy notions of the past, and so lead them on to the recognition and study of real history."

No. 57.

9. I have been directed to dwell the longer on this aspect of the subject because, in His Honor's opinion, it is only by measures of the description above sketched that we can look for success. The object must be sought indirectly rather than directly; and more by gradually rearing up the power and ability of Vernacular authorship than by offering money for translations; by creating, in a word (as we are gradually doing), a body of literate Natives who will demand a literature in their Vernacular. At the same time His Honor thinks that all Local Governments should be encouraged liberally to reward every successful effort made in the direction of Vernacular composition, whether it be by translations, by adapted versions, or by original authorship.

No. 84 G, dated Naini Tal, the 22nd April 1873.

No. 58.

From—M. KEMPSON, Esq., Director of Public Instruction, North-Western Provinces.

To—The Secretary to the Government of the North-Western Provinces.

WITH reference to G. O. No. 2 A, dated 1st January 1873, forwarding copy of a letter No. 477, dated 14th December 1872, from

Mr. R. Griffith, Principal, Benares College.
" A. S. Harrison, ditto, Muir Central College.
" J. Elliott, Professor, ditto.
" W. H. Wright, ditto, ditto.
" A. E. Gough, ditto, Benares College.
" Pundit Aditya Ram, ditto, Muir Central College.

Babu Siva Prasad, C. S. I., Inspector of Schools.

the Government of India in the Home Department, on the subject of translations from English works into the Vernaculars of India, I have the honour to submit the views expressed by the educational officers named in the margin, with the following observations.

2. Para. 2 of Mr. Wellesley's letter remarks that "what has been done in Urdu has been chiefly effected through the instrumentality of the Allygurh Institute"; and, further, that "the series of mathematical works published by Moulvie Zaka Ullah, of Delhi,

* * * is believed to have been commenced at the request and with the assistance of the Allygurh Institute". As regards this, it is true that some of the series bear the inscription "in furtherance of the objects of the scientific societies of Allygurh and Suba Behar"; but the reason of this is that the Manager of the Allygurh Society (I am unable to speak with certainty about the Behar Society) purchased

* Varying from 150 to 250.

a certain number* of copies of part of the series from the author, on condition that the sentence above-quoted was placed on the title page of that portion of the series of which copies were taken. The rest of the series bears the author's name only. The whole was published by him at Delhi and Meerut at his own cost and on his own responsibility alone.

HOME DEPT. PROCEEDINGS, APRIL 1877.

3. As regards the contributions of the Allygurh Society to Urdu literature, I observe that their translations find very few purchasers, and would still cumber the Printing Office were it not that the Education Department takes Rs. 500 worth of books year by year.* The following is a list of the publications :

Rollin's History (the sections relating to Egypt and Greece).

History of China.

A tract on Agriculture.

Mill's Political Economy.

Elphinstone's History of India.

Harris's Rudimentary Electricity.

Wilkinson's Geography (printed for the author).

Malcolm's Persia (recently begun).

During the last three years the only work done has been the printing of a second edition of one of the sections of Rollin (the first having been gradually bought up by the Government), part of Wilkinson's Geography, and Part I. of Malcolm's Persia. With every wish to be successful, the managers seem to have been unprepared for the indifference with which works of this kind are received. They under-estimated the intellectual stagnation of the country from the first, and were too ready to assume that the Government system of education was in fault. The despatch of 1854 had then been little more than a decade in operation, and the teaching of English and the introduction of Vernacular education based upon English principles were then, as now, winning their way slowly. The slowness was and is due to circumstances over which private societies are equally powerless with the Government to exercise control. The recently published report of the Muhammadan Committee of Benares expresses the views of the Allyghur Society from the beginning. The Government is blamed for want of success, and the point is riddance of Government interference in the matter of education so far at least as one section of the community is concerned.

4. Other literary associations, such as those of Bareilly, Moradabad and Meerut, have attempted to encourage a task for reading and inquiry rather than to out-run the demand for books. They have encouraged female education, and have published useful school books and magazines of which the contents are adapted rather than translated from the English.

* One is a History of India and the other a Geography of Asia and India, with notes on each country. The late Rajah Man Singh, of Fyzabad, made use of one of them in a speech which he addressed to the Oudh mutineers in 1857 by way of dissuading them from trying to throw off the English yoke. He afterwards sent a copy of his speech to Babu Siva Prasad in acknowledgment.

The same course has been pursued by individuals. Babu Siva Prasad's *Itihas Timir Nasakh and Bhugol Hastamalak*, both in Hindi, are works of originality and research, and both are well known beyond the limits of the schools.* This author's adaptations of Sandford and Merton, and other such books

for the young, are much liked, and are among the best specimens of Urdu we have.

Moulvie Nazir Ahmed's *Mirat-ul-Arus* and *Banat-un-nash* are strictly original pieces, and surpass anything of the kind yet written in the language. The same author's Urdu treatises on Logic and Arabic Grammar are destined to be the received text books, when Vernacular Oriental education, modelled on English principles, takes its place as the only really popular education of the country. The same may be said of such books as Pundit Kashi Nath's Urdu version

of the *Akhlāq-i-Jalali*, or Lala Sudasukh Lal's of the *Nasiri*. I have mentioned the above as the best samples of what has been done by those who are anxious to promote Vernacular education and literature, though not quite in the same way as the Allygurh Society.

5. As regards the list of books referred to in the correspondence, a large portion of them seemed to me ill-suited for translation when I first saw the list about three years ago. For instance, the series of works on Logic and Moral and Mental Science (Nos. 143 to 165) would be of no utility, according to my view, in the Vernacular supposing it were possible to translate them. The technicalities could be only partially rendered by existing Persian, Arabic or Sanskrit synonyms, and no translator but one who had studied both the Western and Oriental systems would be competent to select the terms. Thought and inquiry in this direction will be best advanced by popularizing the Oriental philosophies in the first instance; and I think it is a matter of regret that the Calcutta University demands an acquaintance with Reid, Abercrombie and Hamilton, rather than with Abu Sina, Nassir-uddin Tusi, and other Oriental thinkers, for the middle examinations in Arts. The works of the Scotch philosophers above-mentioned are crammed by the help of notes and epitomes, and then forgotten. They are the bug-bear of our class rooms. So, too, the history series (Nos. 172 to 215) contains books which can be read with real advantage in the original only, or of which the substance only can be communicated in the Vernacular by advanced scholars with a turn for historical research. As yet the critical faculty is wanting. For physical science only elementary treatises are required. Pure mathematics in Urdu and Hindi are now within the reach of all, and mixed mathematics are in preparation. It would, I believe, be waste of time and energy to translate works which in the nature of things cannot yet be appreciated. As Mr. Griffith says—"There is no reading public." Probably not 5 per cent. of the population can read, and of these the majority have been educated according to the teachings of the old school and desire nothing new. Native society in North-Western India has laboured more than any other part of the peninsula under the disturbing influence of frequent changes, or attempted changes, of rulers, and the result is insouciance, moral and intellectual. Without confidence in themselves or their rulers, the people, as a whole, look to the past and present only. They are too far from their European superiors, and the Native subordinate administration is a barrier rather than a link. Excessive usury and reckless extravagance on certain occasions, which is one of the bad features of the social system, have caused property to change hands for the worse. Poverty is very general. The average Native is insufficiently clothed and fed; and until some mitigation of these distressing circumstances is contrived, social, moral and intellectual progress must be slow. Education is gradually teaching self-reliance, and the establishment of local and municipal committees is now bringing the people nearer to the Government. Nothing was more remarkable during the progress of His Honor's last tour than the friendly way in which the chief non-official representatives of the community were brought into contact with the head of the Government and encouraged to speak out; and nothing is more likely to produce a wholesome feeling of independence.

6. Again, as regards the want of a reading public, it must be remembered that the educational measures inaugurated by the despatch of 1854 have been as yet but a short time under development. The period of one generation even has not been passed, and the class has not yet been created which can give the new system the

prestige of scholarship and success. It is undoubtedly gaining in character and resource, but the majority of its members have stopped short of a thorough education, and care only to win their bread. The minority only are really valuable in an educational sense, but their number is daily increasing, and whether engaged in schools or at the bar, or in Government service, are doing good and encouraging progress. The want of literary enterprise is remarkably illustrated by the catalogues of books registered year by year under the Act. The bulk of the new books thus registered are books used in schools, which serve their purpose and have no further use for the individual, and the remainder are chiefly reprints of religious works and Persian poetry. Under these circumstances it is not yet likely that there should be a circle of readers of works translated from the English, and this consideration tells against the advisability of attempting the systematic translation of a selection such as that put forward by the Allygurh Society.

No. 58.

7. One or two of the writers whose papers accompany this place in a clear light the inutility of the measure on abstract grounds. Babu Siva Prasad, a devoted friend of Vernacular education, takes the practical view and says—"Demand brings supply, but supply cannot create demand. If we are thirsty we can dig a well for water, but water cannot create thirst, even if it comes in inundations." Pundit Aditya Ram agrees with him.

8. My advice is to stimulate the demand, first, by giving a more important part to play in the work of education to the vernaculars; secondly, by promoting Oriental learning side by side with English; and, thirdly, by encouraging original authorship and adaptations of Western learning, rather than translations, which rarely play an important part in literature.

As regards the first point, the attention which the Calcutta University has recently drawn to Vernacular education by publishing a scheme of middle class examinations, is likely to produce valuable results if followed up by a complete course of studies for a higher examination in Vernacular science and Oriental classics. This, however, is probably an undertaking which can be carried out best by provincial administration; but I would again earnestly advocate the concession to candidates for the present Entrance and First Arts Examinations of the Calcutta University of at least the option of taking of Science and the History and Geography of India in their own vernacular. If this is granted, a step will be gained in the struggle against half education and cram, and in the advance of a love of learning for its own sake.

9. Para. 3 of your letter under reply asks what works on the list have to my knowledge been translated into Urdu and Hindi. The first 19 on the list have been translated by Moulvie Zaka Ullah, but there are other translations in currency of English works on elementary mathematics in both Urdu and Hindi. No more are wanted in my opinion. Mixed mathematics in Urdu are now engaging Moulvie Zaka Ullah's attention, and Babu Lakshmi Shankar, M. A., of the Benares College, is working in the same direction in Hindi.

As to engineering, the Roorkee College Press supplies all that is required. Among the works published there, Lieutenant Firebrace's work on Practical Trigonometry, which has been translated into Urdu, is an example of great merit.

No. 47, Airey's Astronomy, has been translated into Urdu by Munshi Gunga Pershad, Secretary to the Moradabad Association,

but he is unable to bring it out for want of diagrams, for which the London publishers want a royalty. No. 58.

No. 59 is the work mentioned on the list of the Allygurh Society's publications in para. 3 above.

No. 208 is in hand now, and No. 211 has been finished by the Society.

None of the histories named in the list have, to my knowledge, been translated, except those above-named; but we have Vernacular compilations of the History of the World for schools, and Dr. Collier's England, which is the Calcutta University text book, has been translated in Lucknow. Geographies are not wanted, and Logic and Mental and Moral Philosophies must either be studied in English, or taken up in the form in which they are treated in the Arabic and Persian standard works. On the whole, I consider that it would under any circumstances be waste of time to translate one-half of the books named, and that of the rest about a quarter has already been translated, and, when mixed mathematics are got over, that quite enough in the way of literal translation has been done for the present.

Dated Allahabad, the 31st January 1873.

From—W. H. WRIGHT, Esq., Professor of English Literature, Muir College.

To—The Director of Public Instruction, North-Western Provinces.

I HAVE been requested to express my views on a subject treated of in a letter from the Government of India to the Secretary to the Government, North-Western Provinces. The subject of the letter is the best mode of securing good translations of standard English works into the Vernacular languages. My view on the subject may be thus briefly expressed:

I.—It appears to me hopeless to attempt to obtain really good translations by offering pecuniary rewards. Such rewards offer no temptations to real scholars, and none but real scholars in every sense of the word are competent to undertake the work.

II.—I do not think that even if good translations be made they will be of much practical use, or much used unless under Government pressure; by this I mean official orders to teachers to prepare their pupils for examination in such books. These subjects are, I think, best studied in the English language, and I am confirmed in my opinion by the views I have heard expressed by several highly educated Natives who have attempted to study to advantage such translations. I do not believe that a "hot-house" Vernacular literature is desirable; nor do I think it at all wanted, having in view the spread of English education which must occur in the next few years.

Dated Allahabad, the 6th February 1873.

From—J. ELLIOTT, Esq., Professor of Mathematics, Muir College, Allahabad.

To—The Director of Public Instruction, North-Western Provinces.

My opinion has been asked respecting the translation of a number of scientific works into the Vernacular languages of India for educational purposes. As apparently Government has not yet fully determined to assist and provide this work of translation by system of pecuniary rewards and honorary distinctions, I shall state my opinion as to the advisability of its co-operating in such an undertaking: and as I believe that Government assistance would be injudicious, ineffectual, and extravagant (compared with the resulting benefits), I shall

not express any opinion on the selection or of the order in which I should consider it expedient the works should be translated. No. 58.

An alien Government, such as ours in India, which is not the expression of public opinion, but which recognises that it has duties to perform and obligations to fulfil, may place before itself consistently one or more of the following objects to justify and guide its interference with the educational and intellectual progress of its subjects.

These are—

1st, to secure to every one a certain minimum of education ;

2nd, to establish and assist (as far as may be considered expedient or necessary) in the proper maintenance of schools and colleges, where any one may obtain an education sufficient for any ordinary professional career at a moderate cost ; and

3rd, to endeavour by any means whatever to develop the peculiar genius of the people, and to obtain its expression in the sciences and arts, in literature, &c.

The first of these I believe to be a duty of the State or Government ; the second expedient, if not necessary, under the conditions of modern civilisation ; the third, on the other hand, I believe it impossible to obtain by any direct interference on the part of Government.

For the first, in India translations of any of the works (except perhaps half a dozen) on the list are not necessary : they are all beyond the scope of the minimum of education as generally understood.

For the second and third, they would be necessary if it were not, as I think, essential that all Natives who go through any real course of professional or scientific education and training should be acquainted with and have learnt to speak and read the English language freely.

The great defect of the present system of Indian education (I by no means wish to deny that it has already produced very considerable results) appears to me to be that it too often not only gives a very imperfect knowledge, a mere smattering of a large number of subjects, but that it apparently encourages the idea that this is what the English call education and intellectual progress. Too often the education of the Native is far more an effort of memory than a development of the intellect, and in nearly all cases he never advances his education beyond what he is absolutely compelled by external circumstances. All who really wish for the spread of education in India should steadily set themselves against this great inherent defect in the Native character.

There is no Native scientific literature of any value at present in existence. Its creation, whether forced or unforced, will be the work of many years, and even then it may be limited in quantity and questionable in quality. Thus the result of encouraging or offering rewards for the work of translation is and must be doubtful. On the other hand, a knowledge of English is an undoubted advantage. It will enable an intelligent Native, not only to lay the foundation of a professional or scientific education, but to advance in it to whatever extent he may wish. A mathematician, an engineer, &c., could not confine his knowledge of his subject to the works on the list. For further and later information he would be compelled in nine cases out of ten to have recourse to English works. So far then as Government assists, directly or indirectly, in promoting and advancing scientific and professional education, it ought, I believe, to do so by insisting

on a thorough knowledge of English as an indispensable element in the course of study.

One of the effects of such an education would (as it ought) undoubtedly be the commencement and gradual development of a Native scientific literature. It would comprise translations as well as compilations, and original investigations and works. But this ought to be a natural result, and not the forced product of an unnatural interference. The want would be gradually experienced, its character gradually ascertained, and the natural and proper result would follow. Supply would meet and accommodate itself to demand. But unless there is really a want felt by any considerable section of the people, such a vast undertaking as suggested would simply end in filling college and other libraries with masses of useless books, and encourage that most objectionable of all literary hacks—the mercenary translator.

So far, therefore, as Government assists in any scientific education it ought to do so, I believe, through, and by means of, the English language.

In addition to the general reasons already stated, there are other objections to Government assisting and co-operating in the translation of such a large number of scientific and philosophical works. Among these are the following :

1st.—Translation of scientific works is not an easy task. The value of a scientific work for educational purposes depends upon the clearness and precision of its language, and upon the fullness with which all the difficulties of the subject have been recognized, discussed and explained. The author must not only therefore have a thorough knowledge of his subject, but have the power of explaining clearly and in plain language the various difficulties if his work is to be really useful. A translator must possess, not only these qualifications, but also a thorough knowledge of the language in which the work he is translating is written.

Hence really useful and valuable translations of scientific works are in any language comparatively rare, and I believe there are very few in India who possess the necessary qualifications.

Sir William Muir's opinion that translations, as a rule, have hitherto been failures, confirms me in the belief that similar translations of scientific works will not only probably, but necessarily, be failures.

2nd.—The majority of the scientific works quoted in the list (as, for example, Todhunter's work) were written expressly for, and adapted to, the English university and public school system of education. This differs greatly in every way from the corresponding system of education in India. To translate literally works prepared in accordance with the requirements of one system to meet the exigencies of another different system, would be to deprive them of one-half of their practical value.

Besides this, the majority of them have, in England, a purely temporary value and position, at least most of them will be superseded by new works of new writers in the course of the next decade. Just as Todhunter's mathematical works banished Hymer's, Earnshaw's, and others at Cambridge, so will his works in turn be ousted by others.

Hence the work of translation would be endless if it were considered necessary for Indian educational purposes to follow closely in the rear of England.

I think I have not only advanced sufficient reasons to show that it is not probable the translations of scientific works would be at present of any value if they are undertaken in the way suggested, but also stated why I think it inexpedient for the Government to interfere in any undertaking of this kind. No. 58.

I hope I shall not be considered as wandering from the subject if, recognizing, as I do most justly, the desire of Government to spread knowledge, and more especially that of the physical sciences, amongst the people of India, I take the present opportunity to state very briefly what I believe to be the only means of effecting this successfully :

1st.—The establishment of schools of physical science, either independent of, or in connection with, the Government colleges. They should be supplied with complete sets of working apparatus, and be under the superintendence of European Professors, not only thoroughly acquainted with their subject, but able to teach it thoroughly and make it interesting. Lectures would form an important part of his duties, but his chief care would be to superintend the experimental training of the students in the various departments of physical science.

2nd.—The creation of a number of scholarships in connection with the schools of physical science sufficiently valuable to induce intelligent Natives who wish to study the physical sciences to devote several years to acquiring a thorough experimental and theoretical knowledge of one or more of them.

In this way, and in this way only, can Government really do anything effectual towards the formation of a body of scientific Natives. Such men would do far more by their mere direct influence towards spreading a knowledge of physical subjects, and increasing that desire, than the translation of any number of English works. They too would be men qualified, not only by knowledge of the subject, but also of the Native character, its defects and requirements, to popularize science and to adapt it to Native thought.

Dated Allahabad, the 7th February 1873.

From—ADITYA RAM, Professor of Sanskrit, Muir College.

To—The Principal, Muir College, Allahabad.

As desired by you, I beg to offer my views on the question of translating English books in the different branches of knowledge into the Vernacular languages of these Provinces.

The question is of vital importance, inasmuch as it relates to the creation of a literature in the language spoken by the people—a literature which will impart the light of knowledge to a greater number of people than if knowledge were imparted through the medium of a foreign language, as it is done now. I have therefore dealt with the question a little largely on its general merits.

The literature of a country is of slow growth, as it takes centuries to produce a Bacon or a Newton; and if it is desirable not to wait for an indefinite length of time in the hope of finding such extraordinary men of the indigenous growth of the soil, the means to create the literature of a country is to translate the works of Bacons and Newtons of other countries. For it has been truly said—the work of an author is a legacy to the future generations of all countries and languages;—it has been the lot of all great nations to improve their literature by the literature of contemporary or older nations. The Romans derived their civilisation and knowledge of the fine arts and sciences from the Greeks, and the modern European nations from both of them. And as Providence has placed the destinies of the 200

millions of the Indian people in the hands of the noble British nation, it would be the misfortune of the people if they do not make the literature of their rulers their own. The people cannot be too grateful to the Government for the step it has taken. The British are the only nation who, though foreign rulers, take an interest in the languages of the people they govern.

The Greeks called every other language save their own barbarian; the Romans did the same. The Arab and other Mussulman conquerors had the same blind veneration to the language of the Koran. It is therefore India's good fortune to be governed by a nation that, possessing the richest literature of their own, revere our classical language, and foster the growth of our vernaculars. I have made these remarks, though out of place here, from a feeling of gratefulness which was too strong to be repressed.

I now come to the main question—as to what books are to be translated, and how to get the work done. The list of books accompanying your docket is a comprehensive one and leaves very little to be added by me. The question rather is that the time has not yet come when competent persons can be found to take up the difficult task of translating the books in the higher branches of the sciences mentioned in that list; nor are there, I believe, any respectable number of readers who want such works now. The law of demand and supply will govern this question.

It is useless to translate the integral calculus, for instance, when there are not pupils who have mastered the elements of mathematics.

The best way is to begin with the elementary works in mathematics and natural philosophy, and the smaller histories of India, England, and the ancient world, and to proceed with the higher works as the students become more advanced every year.

The question then remains how to get the work performed. Government patronage to authors is necessary until the market is full of readers. The Augustan age of Rome and the nine gems of Vikramaditya bear witness to the fact as to the amount of good which a prince can do to the literature of his country by patronising literary men. It is in modern Europe that writers do well without the support of the court. But India is not, I fear, ripe for that yet. Rewards to writers of good merits will bring out happy results. It may be either by introducing the written works in the Government schools, or by helping him to publish his works, or by purchasing the copyright of his book.

The difficult thing is to find competent men who can take up the task. The translators should not only be masters of their own vernacular, but have a fair command of the English language, and be thoroughly conversant with the subject they translate. Our colleges are producing a batch of graduates every year to whom we look for the realization of the scheme.

The great stumbling block to a novice is the want of technical words in the Vernacular corresponding to the English terms in scientific works.

By Vernacular here I mean the Hindi, for it is to that that my remarks are confined. This can be remedied by a glossary of technical terms prepared by qualified men, or an academy of qualified men.

In that case alone can we look to an uniformity in the use of mathematical terms. As it is now, we find a word differently translated by different writers to the great inconvenience of readers. With such facilities put in the way of literary men, and a judicious bestowal of

rewards, we hope much will be done to advance the great scheme of creating a Vernacular literature into a partial if not total realization. No. 58.

I fear I have not done justice to the subject by these hurried remarks, but I hope the greater learning and experience of my senior colleagues will furnish you with useful and practical hints.

Dated Benares, the 5th April 1873.

From—A. E. GOUGH, Esq., Anglo-Sanskrit Professor, Benares College.

To—The Director of Public Instruction, North-Western Provinces.

I HAVE been desired to make a few remarks on the construction of a Europeanised Native literature. These I offer with much diffidence, recognising the difficulty of the question.

The creation of a Vernacular literature must, I think, be a slow tentative process, advancing little by little with, or but slightly before, the growth of the Native mind. The scheme of the Allygurh Institute anticipates results which may or may not belong to the remote future. An extensive and scientific Vernacular literature supposes an extensive and scientific Vernacular education. Such an education offers at present few tangible advantages to students, however pre-requisite to a general enlightenment of the country. To any thorough education, again, the critical exhaustive study of language will be considered instrumental. Such study at once stimulates thought and supplies its materials and expression. In learning a language we acquire the conceptions of those who use it, and these are accumulation of centuries. To Indian students no language can ever be so attractive and valuable as English. Their English studies open to the higher class of Native students an unfailing store of literature, philosophy and science. Those who alone could profit by a Vernacular literature like that suggested by the Allygurh Institute are raised above its need.

For a lower but wider class of students, and for general readers, a supply of healthy popular literature and the encouragement of its study is most desirable. It would be the means of national improvement, while English education would remain that of individual culture. The books provided might be short, easy, interesting and inexpensive. Tales after European models, biographies, histories rich in simple narrative, books of travel, and of general modern information, would probably be most attractive. The treatment of each subject in a graduated series of books would provide for special tastes. To each graduated series one or two advanced text books might be added. The simpler books when read might stimulate further inquiry, and further subsidia would be supplied to the inquirers. Under general information I would include the simplest possible expositions of intellectual and moral science. On these subjects the Native mind is pre-occupied to its distortion, and sound thought and moral feeling is necessary to any elevation of character. The books should be simple but not childish, and constructed in sufficient detail to occupy and interest the reader.

The fabrication and employment of such books would be, for some years at least, artificial, and as to acceptability to the readers, experimental. This is at once an objection to so large a scheme as that sketched by the Allygurh Institute.

The compilation of popular works is attended with many difficulties. New conceptions demand either new words, or the extension or restriction of words already in use. New terms are discouraging, and the old ones mended are misleading to uninstructed readers. Arabic and Sanskrit words, however sparingly, must be introduced

and will give at least the appearance of difficulty. While an enriched vocabulary seems indispensable, it must not be allowed to outstrip too far the current speech. Such are the difficulties, and they can be overcome only by trained and practised writers, who remain earnest students as well as literary workmen. Students who value culture and reasoned truth would gladly, in India as elsewhere, accept a much smaller maintenance if following such pursuits, than they would obtain in other employment. Their work could be only tested by years, and its acceptance, at first under official pressure, by those for whom it is prepared.

No. 58.

Memorandum by R. GRIFFITH, Esq., Principal of the Benares College,—dated Benares, the 8th April 1873.

My objections to the Allypore Society's translation scheme have been anticipated by those who have written before me, and I find I have nothing to add to their remarks. Briefly to sum up, I consider the scheme to be premature, because there is no reading public sufficiently educated to require, appreciate and derive benefit from translations of the works mentioned in the list. I think that the unsystematized multiplication of translation by miscellaneous writers is a positive evil, and that a graduated series of scientific text books should be prepared to meet the demand, which the extension and elevation of Indian vernacular and classical studies may be expected to slowly create. Such books, I think, should be prepared by trained and selected men under the best supervision obtainable. In this way the best educational series in have been given to Classicorum and the Clarendon Press Series Europe, the Catena the world.

Remarks by A. S. HARRISON, Esq., Principal, Muir College, on translations from English works into the vernaculars of India.

It will simplify the subject and explain the widely different opinions expressed by different writers thereon if a few general considerations be premised as to the requirements needed in a translator and the different books suitable for translation.

One class of books demands mere linguistic attainments. Under this head may be placed histories, general geographies, and other works not having a technical language and phraseology.

A second needs the additional faculty of adapting the special ideas of one nation to the corresponding line of thought of another, and comprehends tales, fables and works of fiction generally.

A third and the largest class postulates a good knowledge of the subject treated and embraces all works on science.

Seeing that each science has its own technical phraseology, a further difficulty is here encountered in the due rendering of such terms by fit equivalents.

Again, in the case of sciences new to this country, there arises the necessity of either inventing new words* to express them, or of investing current ones with new and extended meanings.† Both plans must necessarily be adopted,—the former more commonly, the other less frequently,—because of the comparatively fixedness of idea attached to all words and phrases already current.

However judiciously and laboriously this may be attempted, it cannot be accomplished by a single effort. The savants of the

* As in European languages the terms of botany, physiology, &c., are invented from Greek or Latin.

† As was done in the earliest days of Christianity.

Academic failed to fix the French language by their dictionary, and not every kind of coin issuing from the mint obtains currency. Our own scientific literature even of late years affords many examples of unsuccessfully united terms.

No. 58.

The first and second classes of books offer no inherent difficulty, and a liberal system of reward will produce good translations and adaptations of any specified books in them.

Still their circulation remains to be provided for, and that can only be naturally by a developed taste for reading them, or forcedly by introducing them as text books in the higher classes of Vernacular or Anglo-Vernacular schools.

That the taste for reading them is not yet developed is, I think, shown by the comparatively small circulation of the translation of Elphinstone's India, a work fairly translated and put forth under the auspices of the Allygurh Society, the most active Association we have.

As to the third class, considering that the primary object of the Government is the education of the people, the vast mass of books is needed for the young. Now, the earlier lines of thought are moulded and formed in the home, and from home associations which necessarily vary widely with climate, religion, language and mode of life. It may, therefore, be taken as an axiom that all elementary works used in instruction in science should be original compositions by natives of the country. The translation of any book must be so foreign to the ideas of children here in its illustrations and still more in its current of thought as to be utterly unfruitful. The exceptions to this principle might be reckoned easily on the fingers. Balfour Stewart's Science, Primer on Physics, and Airy's six lectures on Astronomy, are the only instances which now occur to me.

Such original compositions can only be produced by those who, having been educated at our colleges in English, do not consider Government employ the sole object of their course. That they may be produced is shown by the works of Pundits Vidyasagar Tarkalunkar and a good many others in Bengal, whose reward has come in the shape of a steady income derived from the sale of successive editions, an income rendering them altogether independent.

I need hardly say that were our less needy students to prolong their course to the B. A. degree, instead of leaving after passing the Entrance Examination, or earlier as is now commonly the case, there would be a body of men from whose ranks such works might be expected, as they would have the requisite leisure, and the love of study certainly grows with its prolongation; but as yet it is not fashionable for them to seek the B. A. degree.

In this looking for original works lies, I conceive, one justification of maintaining expensive English colleges, and it is one which, though less recognised, is not inferior to the more evident one of economy in filling all the subordinate offices of Government with less expensive servants. But it premises that our college classes shall not be attended exclusively by those who are compelled to balance accurately future emoluments against present outlay on study and are ever on the look out for employment.

Mr. Elliott has well remarked on the fleeting popularity and currency of any work on science. As the sciences are perpetually advancing, the text books of one *lustrum* are rejected by the next, and this is true as he points out even of the exact sciences—Geometry and Algebra.

These considerations greatly diminish the number of works which it would be desirable to translate. There are few standard works on

any subject, and the list of the Allygurh Society, though drawn up as late as 1870, contains many which no one now would include in a similar list. No. 58.

I do not conceive that Government can do much in the way of fostering education by offering rewards, though I would not recede from the comparatively small amount now yearly appropriated by Sir William Muir for the purpose in these Provinces, and I think occasionally an honourable distinction might be awarded for eminent labours in this department. Moulvie Zaka Ullah has done much more than any other in these parts, and, as he shows, has worked independently, and he has not ceased working. But his books have hardly attained an adequate circulation, none at all comparable with that which would attend a well written class book (original) for Vernacular schools, and have done little more than compensate him for the outlay. I would suggest, however, that in cases where the copyright of a book becomes the property of Government, a certain royalty on the issue of each new edition should be paid to the author. This I believe would be a real reward, and tend, not only to the production of new books, but also to their amendment in successive editions.

My conclusion is that as far as it may be considered desirable to place before the natives of this country works of the first class it is easy of accomplishment. Many efficient scholars are to be found who could render, for an adequate remuneration, any given history into the vernaculars; but there the proper work of translation may be said to end, and it is hopeless to expect that translation will supply a scientific literature which will advance the education of the country. The man who is qualified to translate *adequately* a work in any branch of science, must be possessed of attainments which will make him equal to the further task of transforming and moulding an existing or writing an entirely new work; and in this public opinion seems to agree when advocating Fellowships to be attached to the Universities, *i. e.*, placing men of ability in positions of ease in order that they may devote themselves to such a task. I press our retaining the upper classes longer in our colleges to attain the same end, not so much on the score of economy as on the consideration that a book emanating from one of rank and influence is more likely to find favour with the public, than the work of an unknown man of lower position, even though the latter work may be critically the better. And we must remember that our books have to make their own way, and must in a measure follow the public taste.

Memorandum by Babu SIVA PRASAD, C. S. I., Inspector of Schools.

THE Government of India has sent a list of 231 books recommended for translation for the education of Indian youths, and wishes to have opinions and advice as to the best mode of securing the important object in view.

The object, as far as I understand, is to create a healthy Vernacular literature and to have all the sciences of Europe in the languages of India.

It is a question for England to decide whether, by the time all the books of the list are translated, printed, taught and learnt, she will not, in these days of daily discoveries, supply us with better books. As far as literature is concerned, I cannot understand why we are to have translations merely and not original works. Men, who cannot create literature are not fit to translate. I should like to see

the History of India, no matter in what language it is, written by an Indian. Dowson writes a History of India as told by her own historians. Is it impossible for her own sons to write it in their mother tongue? No. 58.

Demand brings supply, but supply cannot create demand. If we are thirsty we can dig a well for water, but water cannot create thirst even if it comes in inundations.

It is for the Government to think first of the demand. I have heard from Moulvie Zaka Ullah that eight of his translations (high branches of mathematics) are still lying almost entirely unsold. The cause of this want of demand is very evident, such books can be taught and learnt only in the high schools and colleges, and the course of study there is framed by the Calcutta University. Till the University makes it optional for graduates and under-graduates to pass examinations in sciences either in their mother tongue or a foreign language, we cannot expect much improvement in the demand. The case is quite different with elementary books. We have plenty of elementary schools, and we fix their course of study.

However, if the object of the Government is simply to have the books named in the list translated (no matter whether there is a demand or not), still the difficulty remains unsurmountable. Before wishing for good translations, we must create good translators. Why did not the penny-a-line system of translation succeed in Delhi? I was there and saw the process with my own eyes. The teachers distributed pages to boys. The boys took dictionaries and translated. The teachers at the end of the day corrected and submitted the whole to the Principal. Let the Government find out how many Indians there are whom the Government has taught all the sciences enumerated in the list. In fact, the best and most useful sciences are scarcely taught in Government colleges. The Calcutta University discourages by all means the study of sciences. It was but last year that the Calcutta University created some optional triposes, but when some of the under-graduates went to some of the Principals and expressed their desire to take up sciences, the Principals plainly told them that there was no means at hand for that, and the poor under-graduates were obliged to content themselves with sermons, analogies and philosophies.

The case turns out to be exactly this—that the Government expects translations of scientific books from those who know nothing of those sciences.

Enhancement of reward will not remove the difficulty. The rewards offered by the Local Government would have remained for the most part unclaimed had not the standard of judgment been lowered for the sake of encouragement.

All along the foreign conquerors had forced their language on the conquered, and have had the literature of the conquered translated in their own languages; but here the man will be thought mad who thinks it possible that some day in the long run of time English may become the language of this country, though the Mikado has made it the language of Japan simply for its own sake. Our conquerors are trying to learn our language and wish to see their literature translated in that. To us Indians this is a novelty indeed.

Now if we earnestly wish to have really good translations of scientific books, there are only two ways of achieving the purpose: Either let the colleges have the means of teaching all the sciences to produce men like Babu Rajendra Lala Mitra, Dr. Mohendra Lal

HOME DEPT. PROCEEDINGS, APRIL 1877.

22

Sirkar and Dr. Bhaudaji, or offer such high rewards as to induce European scholars to learn our vernaculars and undertake translations like Dr. Ballantyne. No. 58.

Memorandum by M. KEMPSON, Esq., Director of Public Instruction, North-Western Provinces,—dated the 19th April 1870.

THE terms of the Right Honourable the Secretary of State's despatch refer to a stated epoch, but I venture to glance at the period which immediately precedes the assumption of authority by the Crown, because in it the germs of progress in the formation of a Vernacular literature are found. And here the remark at once suggests itself that the first step towards the formation of a useful Vernacular literature was taken when Mr. Thomason established the system of village schools. The vernacular had no literary currency. The most enthusiastic student found little to repay perusal in the clumsy Urdu poets who followed Amir Khusru. The language had but recently been introduced into the courts, and had gained no vigour or pliancy. There was no such thing as a Native grammar. The rise of Vernacular education made the want felt, and was the cause of a large number of elementary school books being brought out, chiefly by the care and energy of my predecessor, Mr. H. S. Reid, and by the aid of Government. The foundation of a Vernacular literature was thus laid. It is true that before this time, some fifteen years before the mutiny, a Translation Society had been established at Delhi in connection with the Government College, and a number of educational works—historical, philosophical and mathematical—had been brought out partly at the expense of the Government; but its labours seem to have been premature and to some extent ill-directed; and it is enough for me now to refer to the abler minutes on the Society's publications which may be found in the Selections of the Records of Government, North-Western Provinces, Vol. III., 1867, page 395. The supply exceeded the demand, and sufficient care had not been taken to secure elegance and exactness. Quantity, not quality, was the gauge of successful rendering. A large stock of these books was destroyed in the mutiny, and specimens are now very scarce. Nevertheless, the move was one in the right direction, and would have borne excellent fruit in time. Later on, Dr. Ballantyne, Principal of the Benares College, devoted his industry and talents to the re-production of English philosophy and science in Sanskrit. His object was to convey the knowledge of Western learning to the Brahmins through the medium of their sacred tongue. His translation of the *Novum Organon* may be cited as a work of great erudition, and the *Synopsis of Science* is a still greater achievement. His books were published by the Government at a great expense; but it may be doubted whether any really useful results have followed. Mr. Middleton, of the Agra College, worked in a different direction. Instead of translating English scientific works, he prepared a syllabus of lectures, which was published in Urdu, and was intended to convey the results of European learning to the Native mind. The defect of this work, and of all similar attempts, was its sketchiness. It stated results rather than processes of thought, and was valueless educationally, except in the hands of able tutors, who could not then be found. There still remained much that was valuable in a terminological sense, notwithstanding the war of opinion as to the propriety of devising technical equivalents, when the classical Oriental languages failed to supply them, or, on the other hand, of merely transliterating the foreign terms.

2. The residuum of the efforts of the few years which preceded the mutiny is our Vernacular school literature. Mr. Reid's school books have supplied the wants of many generations of school-boys in the North-Western Provinces, Oudh and the Punjab, in History and Geography, Arithmetic, Algebra and Euclid, Mensuration and easy Political Economy. They have been amended or replaced from time to time, and other treatises have been prepared by way of extension or illustration, to which may be added a constantly increasing list of map, prize books, editions of ordinary Persian class books, &c., &c., the whole forming a body of science in the Vernacular, which is sufficient to enable a youth to pass the Matriculation Examination of the Calcutta University in all branches of proficiency required, except the English language. No. 58.

3. After the mutiny, while purely Vernacular education was pushed on by the aid of these books, important modifications of the college system were introduced; and as the progress of literature is intimately connected with these changes, I shall briefly allude to them and their results. The purely Oriental departments at Government colleges had gained considerable repute and popularity, for they involved the least possible disturbance of existing methods; but the students, while studying at the cost of the State, gained nothing which was likely to draw them towards, or interest them in the character of, the governing class. When the outbreak occurred the Moulvies became, or were suspected of becoming, fomenters of sedition, and the bearing of the students was unsatisfactory. On the restoration of order, it was decided to place the colleges in affiliation with the Calcutta University, then newly-founded, at once, and to discontinue purely Oriental teaching, except at Benares, where the Sanskrit College had been founded under peculiar circumstances and the same unpleasantness had not arisen. This movement was in harmony with a growing demand for an English education, which followed the establishment of our rule on a firmer basis, and marked a keen appreciation by the Natives of the crisis which had been passed. English, therefore, became the chief element in collegiate education; but the students were carefully instructed in their own vernacular, and in the "second languages" prescribed by the University standards. The result of this kind of change was a work of time only, and it was hardly to be expected that any direct effect upon the popular tone of thought, or any new impulse to literary enterprise, would be observed for many years. But here and there Native officials who had taken the opportunity of learning English when it was less popular were making their influence felt, and their hands were slowly strengthened by the class of better educated men who were beginning to enter life in various capacities. Increased interest in the affairs of the country and the proceedings of Government was one of the earliest characteristics of the new era. By and by Vernacular newspapers appeared in several of the chief towns. Before the mutiny there was only one paper in the North-Western Provinces at Agra, and that in Persian, and two periodicals,—one a kind of educational magazine edited by Mr. Reid, and the other a paper called the *Budh Prakash*. The new papers received encouragement from the Government. One deserves special mention for the example it afforded of careful and intelligent editing. This was the *Muhib-i-riaya*, of Etawah, which was managed by the Collector, Mr. Hume. The patronage bestowed upon these journals was repaid by a generally friendly tone, especially in the matter of education, and by increased pains in their editing. It is true that their circulation was limited, but still they were circulated, and performed, as they perform now, a useful literary service in

24

()

Index
No.

EDUCATION.

Progs.
No.

HOME DEPT. PROCEEDINGS, APRIL 1877.

No. 58.

popularising the vernacular as a medium of communicating thought and feeling. In aiding their circulation the Government was, therefore, directly aiding literary progress in the country. I may add that there are now 26 newspapers and eight periodicals in circulation.

The next symptom of life was the spontaneous formation of societies or associations for self-improvement and the promotion of literature. All such efforts were duly fostered and encouraged, but the principle was observed of evoking independent action by leaving the members to carry out their plans on their own resources as far as possible. The Government officials have lent their personal aid and support to these undertakings, and they show many hopeful signs of usefulness.

The first of these was formed at Benares in 1861 by the name of the Benares Debating Society. It is under the patronage of the Maharajah, and is now called the Benares Institute. The published transactions of this Society are very interesting, especially those which concern education and literary topics.

The Satya Sabha of Agra was next formed (1864), and very considerable subscriptions were raised by the Hindu gentry for its maintenance. Its object was the advancement of learning and truth, and it not only advocated the extension of education to women, but opened girls' schools in the city. These were aided at starting by the Government, and still exist under inspection. The Society has, moreover, contributed a useful literary journal, the *Abihyat Hind*, to the public stock of information, which is well supported by the community and receives Government patronage. It has, moreover, edited several books which are in use in our schools.

The Scientific Society of Allygurh owes its origin about the same time to Syud Ahmed of the judicial service—a man of much personal energy and independence of thought, but from the first impatient of Government control in the education of the country and jealous of the anglicising process. The object of the Society was the diffusion of useful knowledge in all departments by means of publications in Urdu, and by providing a library and reading-room for the public use. It has published a few translations of English works on history and physical science chiefly, which are an improvement on the versions of the Delhi Translation Committee, of which mention has been already made, but do not command a sale, and, being ill-adapted for tutorial uses, have no circulation in our schools except as prize books. The Society receives an annual advance of Rs. 500 from the Government for publishing purposes. Later on it showed signs of becoming a political rather than a literary association, and a gazette was issued in which matters of national rather than educational or literary interest are brought forward. Education receives considerable attention, but is viewed from a political rather than an economic point of view.

Soon after the prospectus of the Allygurh Society appeared, a literary association was formed by some of the leading Hindu gentlemen at Bareilly. Its objects were purely literary, and its intention was, if funds were found, to encourage the growth of a wholesome Vernacular literature by offering rewards for competition. The funds collected were insufficient, and its labours have hitherto been confined to the publications of useful school-books in the Vernacular, and to the maintenance of a literary journal, called the *Bareilly Review*, which has been in circulation since. Political matters are not treated in this periodical. Social and educational articles, local history and now and then literary criticism, make up

the bulk of the contents. Two hundred and fifty copies of this journal are subscribed for by the Government, and the Society receives an advance of Rs. 500 yearly in aid of its labours generally. No. 58.

There are societies of the same useful kind at Futtehpur, Etawah, Gorakhpur and Allahabad, and of still later formation at Moradabad, Cawnpore, Meerut and Chunar. The Moradabad Association conducts a useful literary journal, which receives Government patronage. The Societies of Etawah and Meerut publish their proceedings for the public benefit, and many of the papers are exceedingly good. Those of last-named Society have been occasionally reviewed by me for His Honor's information, and he has recently conferred the honour of a public visit on the Society.

4. The growth of this new order of things has been gradual, not spasmodic, and the encouragement which has been given has acted beneficially. Self-concerted measures for social, moral and intellectual reform are a healthy symptom, but as yet authors or reformers have a limited field for action. The reading public is small, as my recent reports on the Native Press will have shown, and the country book-stalls are still wholly furnished with reprints of the old unwholesome materials. Not the least of the important services which have been rendered by Mr. Thomason's school system has been the creation of a class of readers whom the promoters of reform could immediately benefit by their books and publications, and we may hope that the same causes which have moved the spirit of reform during the last ten years will in time enlarge its sphere of operation.

5. I pass on to the more direct encouragement which the Government now offers. Entering office in 1868, Sir William Muir's attention was drawn to the means of more directly promoting the formation of a Vernacular literature. A notification, copy of which is enclosed for reference, was issued by him in August of that year offering prizes for competition. I venture to notice the results of His Honor's notification with some particularity, because it seems to be the kind of encouragement about which information is wanted by the Right Honourable the Secretary of State for India, but also with diffidence, for the business involved has been left to my management, and the task is beyond my ability in connection with other onerous duties.

Welcomed as the notification was by the Native community, it was partly misunderstood by a large class. These were the privately educated scholars of the old régime, who view with apprehension the decline of purely Oriental learning before English teaching and science. These hailed the notification with delight, and hastily putting their Arabic and Persian lore into a Vernacular dress, however careless and ill-arranged, lost no time in claiming reward. Fully satisfied with the old philosophy and science, and despising the Vernacular, these men served up extracts from the ordinary classical literature of Upper India in weak and ungrammatical Urdu, heedless of two main objects expressed in the notification, viz., originality and depth of thought, and the adaptation of the spoken language to serve the purposes of literature and science. Of 112 manuscripts received within one year after the issue of the notification, three-fourths were by Muhammadan scholars—a class which has hitherto refused, as a body, to profit by new teachings.

The matter of these manuscripts was drawn from the same sources and kept continually re-appearing, and the majority were badly, because hastily, written. In contrast with these ready writers, the members of the newly-educated class have been more deliberate.

Few of them, as yet, have equipped themselves for authorship. They have learned English as a means of obtaining a living and generally without a corresponding cultivation of Oriental literature from which to enrich their vocabulary, or quote with grace. They have not as yet begun to study English for the sake of its literature, or with a view of imparting information to their fellows. But this notwithstanding I notice that all the best rewards which have been bestowed have fallen to their share, and I have every reason to hope that they will ere long occupy the domain of Vernacular authorship with profit to themselves and others. Of the two maximum rewards (Rs. 1,000) which have been given, one fell to a Hindu mathematician of Indian and European renown—Pundit Bapu Deo Shastri, of the Benares College—whose acquirements are sound in Western as well as Eastern science; the other to a Muhammadan official who, besides being an excellent Arabic and Persian scholar, is well versed in English. Two other rewards of Rs. 500 were gained by Hindu gentlemen, one of whom belongs to a family of Kashmiri Brahmins, well known for literary culture, both Oriental and English; and the other is a ripe Sanskrit scholar who adds a good acquaintance with the English language to his Sanskrit learning. Thus the first general inference from the results of the notification so far is the soundness of the expectation of those who look with confidence to the present system of education, which gives direct access to Western disciplines as more likely to result in the development of a useful literature in the Vernacular than to the use of the Oriental classics as the vehicle of renovation.

No. 58.

6. It remains to add a few details in connection with the notification respecting (1) authors, (2) language, (3) subjects, (4) rewards, and I note that the statistics extend to the end of last month (March 1870), *i. e.*, for one year and seven months, since the issue of the notification only.

I.—*Authors.*—Of 203 works which I have reviewed during this interval 114 were by Muhammadans, 83 by Hindus, and six by Christians. The Muhammadans are out of all proportion. Their readiness to write makes it all the more matter of regret that they adhere to the old paths.

As to localities, 153 of the competitors whose works have been reviewed are residents of the North-Western Provinces, nineteen of the Punjab, seventeen of Oudh, five of Bengal, five of the Central Provinces, and four of Independent States. The large towns furnish the largest numbers of contributors; for example, 24 are from Agra alone, 17 from Allahabad, 14 from Meerut, 12 from Moradabad, 12 from Delhi, 11 from Bareilly, seven from Benares, and from Lahore and Lucknow six each. Of places in the North-Western Provinces not already named, Lalitpur has eight, Hattrass seven, Jaloun six; Shahjahanpur, Cawnpore and Fatehgarh five each; Etah, Budaon and Jounpur four each; Ghazeepur and Etawah three each; Allygarh, Jhansie, Gorarkhpur and Banda two each; and Bijnour, Roorkee, Ajmere, Chunaor, Humeerpur and Darow one each. This list shows that the notification has attracted very general attention.

II.—*Language.*—Of the 203 competitive works sent in 164 are in the Urdu language and 39 only in Hindi. Coupled with the circumstance that the majority of the contributors are Muhammadans, this is not surprising. Yet as more than half of the *Hindu* competitors write in Urdu, it is a fair inference that Urdu is regarded as the aptest vehicle for literary purposes. I am unable to speak highly of the style or precision of the writing generally. There have been brilliant exceptions, such, for instance, as the *Mirat-ul-Arus*, the

diction of which is elegant without being pedantic, and is free from bad taste or hyperbole. Many of the competitors wrote in evident haste and committed orthographical blunders which a school boy would have avoided; others wrote without attention to grammar, and one writer began by stating that he had purposely neglected the rules. Another obvious defect was the tendency to use difficult Persian and Arabic words where other commoner terms might have been found. Another was the fondness shown for the *mukaffa* style, especially in the manuscripts which came from places within the influence of Lucknow. Rhyming prose is objectionable from the obligation under which the writer labours of finding words of the right sound rather than the right sense. As regards Hindi, the very limited use of the language as a literary medium of late years has resulted in the absence of good models, and most of the attempts were awkward and ungrammatical, and the persistent avoidance of Persian and Arabic words necessitated the introduction of unintelligible Sanskrit terms. Only one treatise of merit as a literary work, the *Niti Sadha Taran-gini*, was sent up by a Pundit in the Government Translator's Office.

No. 58.

III.—*Subjects*.—The annexed schedule* will convey an idea of the choice of subjects by the various competitors. More than half of the works specially intended by their authors for the use of schools and therefore ranked as “educational”, were drawn up with an eye to female education, that having been

* Educational	...	77
Literary	...	60
Scientific	...	20
Morals	...	19
History	...	14
Grammar	...	13
Total	...	203

mentioned as a desirable subject in the notification. These are mostly short treatises consisting of a statement of the necessity of female education, with extracts considered suitable for the study of women and girls. Nothing of real value was contributed, except the series of Hindi Readers compiled by Pundit Ram Jasan, of the Benares College, for which a reward of Rs. 500 has recently been given by the Lieutenant-Governor. Of works called literary, the majority are attempts at romance-writing or story-telling, of which several have received rewards. Pre-eminent among those was the *Bride's Mirror*, by Nazeer Ahmad, rewarded by a prize of Rs. 1,000, and specially noticed by His Honor in durbār. About one-fifth of these were poetical. The works on morals consisted almost entirely of extracts from Persian books, and were marked by so great a uniformity that it was evident the writers had used the same books. The most deserving was the *Akhlaq-i-Kashi*, a manual of etiquette and behaviour based on Persian books of repute and well adapted for introduction into Vernacular schools. A khilat of Rs. 500 was given to the author. Of scientific works the chief were mathematical, and some of them received notice as worthy of reward. The great merits of Pundit Bapu Deva's Algebra were acknowledged by a Rs. 1,000 prize. Nothing of value was contributed in either history or grammar.

IV.—*Rewards*.—I have already incidentally noticed the chief prizes which have been bestowed. They have varied in amount from Rs. 1,000 to Rs. 50. The sum spent was Rs. 6,630, of which Rs. 3,000 went to four competitors in the shape of two prizes of Rs. 1,000 and two of Rs. 500, the remainder was assigned in sums of smaller amount to 29 others.

In additton to this kind of reward a few of the better manuscripts have been printed, and the author's name thus brought before the public, which is an honour highly esteemed. Of such books and of a few others which were sent up in a lithographed form, though

they are included among the manuscripts in the above description, about 7,000 copies have been taken for use in our Vernacular schools. No. 58.

On the whole nearly 25 per cent. of the competitors have met with encouragement of one sort or the other. The actual result is that a few really valuable accessions to our Vernacular literature have been made, quite as numerous and quite as valuable as could have been reckoned upon with any confidence at starting. A more general result is the attention which the subject has received.

7. I am glad to be able to add to this account an instance of direct encouragement to the spread of literature in the Vernacular given last year by a Native Chief of high position in the North-Western Provinces. I allude to the Maharajah of Benares' offer of Rs. 10,000 for the translation of an encyclopædia. Arrangements for carrying out the Maharajah's proposal have been made, but a difficulty has recently occurred which, it is feared, will hinder the undertaking entirely, viz., the refusal of Messrs. Chambers to permit articles of their publication to be translated. The refusal has caused much discouragement at Benares. The object of the Maharajah's offer was for the benefit of his fellow-countrymen: commercial interests were unthought of.

No. 2279 A, dated Camp Pillibheet, the 9th December 1868.

From—R. SIMSON, Esq., Secretary to the Government of the North-Western Provinces.

To—The Secretary to the Government of India.

I AM directed to acknowledge the receipt of your letter No. 28—214, dated the 14th April last, and endorsement No. 205 of the same date, forwarding a copy of a despatch No. 5, dated the 31st January last, from the Right Honourable the Secretary of State for India, on the subject of encouraging Vernacular literature, and particularly Vernacular compilations from moral English works on a single subject.

2 In reply I am directed to submit the accompanying copies of

No. 2479, dated the 24th March 1868.

No. 876, dated the 24th July 1868.

No. 998, dated the 14th August 1868.

No. 1150, dated the 5th September 1868.

No. 1393, dated the 16th October 1868.

the very interesting and suggestive letters marginally noted, which Mr. Kempson, the

Director of Public Instruction, has written on this important subject.

3. In his letter dated the 16th October last, Mr. Kempson shows that substantial aid and encouragement has been offered by this Government in such ways as seemed open to it for the promotion of literature in the Vernacular.

4. Within the last four or five years 59,000 copies of 63 different works published by the authors or by societies have been purchased by Government at a cost of Rs. 18,721. The greater portion of these books are distributed as prizes.

5. Nine periodicals and papers in the Vernacular are also subscribed for by the Educational Department to the number of 2,135 copies at a monthly cost of above Rs. 1,000.

6. A yearly advance of Rs. 500 is made to each of the Literary Societies of Aligarh and Bareilly, which is repaid to Government in works published by those Societies.

7. In accordance with the sanction given by the orders of the Governor General in Council, No. 391, dated the 8th July last, the Lieutenant-Governor issued a notification, of which a copy is enclosed, offering rewards of Rs. 1,000 for Vernacular works. Treatises

have already been received from various quarters in consequence, showing that the notification has attracted attention widely, and in process of time some satisfactory results may reasonably be anticipated. No. 58.

8. In his letters of 24th March and 24th July last Mr. Kempson has discussed various points more or less connected with the question under reply. Most of his views are based upon sound principles.

9. Especially the Lieutenant-Governor believes that a Vernacular literature must be of spontaneous growth. It cannot be "created to order". To be popular, it must be indigenous. The author must select his own ground, and must approach it from his own point of view. Only so is it to be expected that he will produce a work, Native in its dress and suitable in its modes of thought. Impressed with this conviction, the Lieutenant-Governor, in the offer of rewards above-noticed, left the choice of them and mode of treatment absolutely in the author's hands.

10. But though we cannot *force* a Vernacular literature, much may be done by Government to provide the conditions under which its growth is possible and may be expected. In the Lieutenant-Governor's opinion the present system does to a great extent provide those conditions. What we want are scholars imbued with sound European learning, well versed also in their own Vernacular, and the classical sources from which it has been enriched. The former will furnish the staple of thought, the latter the medium by which it is to be conveyed attractively. To encourage either to the exclusion of the other would fail of producing scholars fitted to create an impression on their country.

11. Something in this direction has been attempted in the Anglo-Sanskrit Department of the Benares College, but hitherto without any fruit. It was the hope of Mr. Thomason and Mr. J. Muir that the combination of European and Sanskrit studies would develop a sound philosophy and elegant literature in a form acceptable to the nation. The Lieutenant-Governor on a late occasion sought to draw the attention of the Anglo-Sanskrit students to the disappointment of these expectations in the hope that they might be stimulated to some fruitful exertions. A copy of the speech delivered on this occasion by Sir William Muir is enclosed.

12. Holding these views, the Lieutenant-Governor does not concur with Mr. Kempson in regretting that a classical language has been made imperative in the superior University examinations, but His Honor would have added Persian to the number. His Honor would also be glad to see honours given by the University for proficiency in the Oriental classics to students who had already proved that they possessed a competent knowledge of English. In the orders on the administration report for last year His Honor remarked in this sense: "If the prospect of honours in the Oriental classics could be held out to such as had succeeded in passing, say the Middle University Examination, it might tend to lead those who by a fair English education have acquired precious stores of European knowledge to prosecute the Oriental studies which would qualify and fit them for communicating those treasures to their fellow-countrymen in an elegant Vernacular style, and in conformity with Native modes of thought and illustration."

13. If a popular and standard literature were thus created, the Lieutenant-Governor does not doubt that there would be a large demand for it. As shown by Mr. Kempson, the number of persons qualifying themselves in the Vernacular is rapidly increasing, and

there is no suitable intellectual food provided for them. The great mass of works that issue from the Press are either theological or amatory. The want of instructive and amusing books suitable for women is especially to be deplored, and forms at present a serious objection in the Native mind to the promotion of female education.

No. 58.

14. The Lieutenant-Governor concurs with Mr. Kempson in attesting the hopeful results that have already been produced by the educational policy of the Government. The advantages to be derived from a study of English are everywhere becoming better appreciated, and institutes and literary societies are springing up in various directions exhibiting symptoms of life and interest. The District Educational Committees established by the late Lieutenant-Governor also often display an intelligent interest in the work of education.

15. Excepting for technical works and the exact sciences, the Lieutenant-Governor does not hope for much from mere translations. Great sums were expended before the mutiny on translations by the Delhi Translation Society; the Lieutenant-Governor believes that not one of these ever came into circulation, or has survived the mutiny. They were exotics not suited to the country. An instructive report of these by a committee appointed by the late Mr. J. R. Colvin will be found in the Selections from the Records of this Government (Vol. III. of 1867, page 395). This topic was also alluded to in an Urdu address by the Lieutenant-Governor to the Aligarh Institute, a copy and translation of which as bearing on the subject under discussion is herewith enclosed (*Aligarh Gazette*, No. for May 22nd, 1868, pages 330 and 331).

No. 2690, dated Lahore, the 12th July 1873.

No. 59.

From—T. H. THORNTON, Esq., D. C. L., Secretary to the Government of the Punjab.

To—The Offg. Secretary to the Government of India.

In your letter No. 478, dated 14th December last, you ask for the opinion and advice of the Honourable the Lieutenant-Governor of this Province as to the best mode of obtaining good Vernacular translations of English scientific works.

2. In reply I have the honour, by direction of the Lieutenant-Governor, to forward herewith copy of two communications upon the important subject,—one from Dr. G. W. Leitner, Registrar, Lahore University College, with enclosures, and the other No. 118, dated 9th May 1873, from Mr. Cordery, Officiating Director of Public Instruction in this Province.

3. In these documents the Government of India will find many useful suggestions, and there is much, His Honor considers, to commend in the scheme proposed by Mr. Cordery; nevertheless the Lieutenant-Governor retains the opinion he has long held that the best practical way of effecting the object in view in the present circumstances of India is by the appointment of a committee of liberally paid translators who would devote their whole time and attention to the subject.

4. The system of offering prizes for the production of such translations to open competition was proved a complete failure in this Province, and His Honor is not sanguine that the scheme proposed by Mr. Cordery, however theoretically appropriate, will prove practically successful so far as the Punjab is concerned; all the really good English and Urdu scholars already hold appointments under Government, and would not consequently have sufficient time to devote to

Index
No.

()
E D U C A T I O N .

Progs.
No.

HOME DEPT. PROCEEDINGS, APRIL 1877.

the translation and adaptation of English works into the Vernacular in addition to the duties of their office, so that the most competent Native scholars would be practically excluded from participation in the work, unless placed on special duty for the purpose. No. 59.

Memorandum No. 1, dated Lahore, the 11th January 1873. No. 60.

IN reply to his No. 119, dated Camp, 8th January 1873, begs to state that the subject of "Translation" has already engaged the attention of the Senate of the Punjab University College. Earl Mayo forwarded a copy of Sayad Ahmad's list to this office, whence it was circulated to members of the Senate. The result of these enquiries was finally embodied in enclosed demi-official letter to the address of Major Burne, and approved by the Senate, which also adopted the views of the under- signed in his "Sinin-ul-Islam", Part I., regarding the greater advantage of "adaptation" Vernacular translation. A copy of these views is enclosed, as also a memorandum by Babu Nobin Chandr on Hindi, and one by Dr. Trumpp on the same subject (in a review of a Sanskrit manuscript).

A report of a modern Arabic treatise on "Anatomy" sent to this office by His Excellency the late Viceroy is also enclosed, as the remarks in paras. 6 and 9 may be deemed to be of general application. The following papers are enclosed :

I.—Detailed report on Sayad Ahmad's List.

II.—Adaptation Vernacular translation into Urdu and the vernaculars generally.

III.—Translation into Hindi.

IV. Ditto Sanskrit and Punjabi.

V. Ditto Arabic.

G. W. LEITNER,

Registrar, Punjab University College.

To the Secretary to the Govt. of the Punjab.

PAPERS REFERRED TO IN THE ABOVE MEMORANDUM.

I.—DETAILED REPORT ON SAYAD AHMAD'S LIST.

1.—Translation from English into Urdu.

Demi-official to Major O. T. BURNE, Private Secretary to His Excellency the Viceroy, circulated for opinion or sanction among Members of the Senate,—dated Punjab University College, Lahore, the 15th February 1871.

I BEG to communicate to you, for His Excellency the Viceroy's information, the results at which, after careful consideration, the Executive Committee of the Punjab University College have arrived with regard to the list of books proposed to be translated into Urdu by Sayad Ahmad Khan, which was enclosed in your letter dated Calcutta, 21st November 1870.

I have already, at your request, expressed to you my own opinion regarding the principles on which "translation" rests. In this opinion, especially as submitted in my Preface to the "Sinin-ul-Islam", of which I venture to send you a copy, the Committee fully concur. I shall be very happy to submit, if required, my views in further detail on the "Theory and Practice of Translation" from English or other European language into the Urdu, and to propose a "graduated educational course" suited to the requirements of the country, and systematising the production of books throughout India, which now goes on subject to no general plan.

At present, however, I will confine myself to the expression of the view of the Committee regarding the matter immediately in hand, viz., "the practicability of the translation into Urdu of all or any of the books mentioned in Sayad Ahmad's list".

In the first place it is necessary to point out that the "persons who have recommended the books", whilst deserving our respect for their eminence in their own specialities, do not, most of them, possess a knowledge of Urdu, which alone can entitle them to speak with authority on the subject. At the same time it must

be admitted that we have no evidence whatever justifying us in believing that the "persons who have recommended" the list have committed themselves to giving more to it than their general approval. We do not know the list has been submitted to them, and there is a wide difference between the acquiescence in the general proposition that it would be very desirable to translate good, if not the best, books into Urdu, and the subscription of a scholar to any statement involving his imprimatur, with regard to the mode of classification and selection of books for a particular and well defined purpose.

The "List" must, therefore, be considered on its own merits and with special reference to what is immediately practicable. We require a *few* books to begin with, not a Publisher's catalogue, and these books should be chosen with regard solely to their importance and translatability. These few books might be done simultaneously by different scholars in India, or their translation might be entrusted to one committee. The Executive Committee of the Punjab University College will gladly undertake the general supervision of the work, provided that sufficient encouragement were given by the formation of a Government fund to pay translators. Their appointment will be recommended subject to the following conditions :

- (1.) Thorough knowledge of the subject.
- (2.) Do. do. of English and Urdu.

These translators will be directed, not only to follow the development of the English original, but also to imbue themselves with the full *meaning* rather than the *form* of the passages to be translated, for the Committee think with me that Urdu does not want so much "translations" as "adaptations", and that it is more important to introduce the *subjects* in a simple and idiomatic manner than the literal translations of writers on these subjects.

The Committee now beg to submit the titles of those books in the list which they can recommend, subject to a main division into "A.—Scientific" and "B.—Literary."

"A.—Scientific."

Premising with the general remark that Nos. 21, 48 and 142 (all belonging to Physics) are widely separated by being placed under different heads, although similar in scope, and that such books as No. 132 "Hand-book of American Farming", No. 133 "Tropical Cultivation", and No. 134 "Hand-book of the Mechanical Arts in the Construction of Houses", are all included under *Chemistry* with which they have little or nothing to do, the Committee consider that, on the whole, the translation of scientific books (or books imparting a knowledge of things, facts and processes) does not present insuperable difficulties :

Thus (*vide* List)—

I.—"Physical Science."

- (a.) Mathematics—easy. Applied Mathematics—more difficult.
- (b.) Statics and Hydrostatics—slightly difficult.
- (c.) Astronomy—not difficult.
- (d.) Electricity—Terms can be found in Arabic.
- (e.) Optics—difficult. No. 70 could be done without much difficulty.
Acoustics—not very difficult.

II.—"Biological Science"—very difficult, as also III.—"Geological Science", but here the terms could be arranged by a committee.

The following books deserve, in our opinion, to be immediately taken in hand :

- No. 10. Todhunter's Plane Co-ordinate Geometry.
20. Parkinson's Elementary Mechanics.
22. Rawlinson's Elementary Statics.
25. Phear's Elementary Hydrostatics or Besant's (No. 23).
28. Dynamics of a particle.
33. Rankine's Manual of Civil Engineering.
34. The Engineer's Hand-book (Lowndes).
35. Useful information for Engineers (Cresy).

- No. 39. Rankine's Manual of Applied Mechanics.
47. Airy's Popular Astronomy.
48. Ganot's Physics.
52. De La Rive's Treatise on Electricity.
67. Parkinson's Treatise on Optics.
70. Tyndall's Heat as a mode of Motion.
74. Tyndall on Sound.
82. Carpenter's Human Physiology.
83. Huxley's Elements of Comparative Anatomy.
90. Van der Hoeven's Hand-book of Zoology.
93. Oliver's Introduction to Indian Botany.
99. Oliver's Lessons in Elementary Botany.
101. Lyell's Elements of Geology.
105. Lyell's Principles.
112. Ansted's Physical Geography (is being translated).
116. Phillips's Mineralogy.
125. Miller's Elements.
133. Phillips's Tropical Cultivator.
136. Johnston's Chemistry of Common Life.
142. Elements of Physics, by Arnot.

No. 60.

" B.—Literary."

The Committee beg to draw your attention to the remarks contained at pages 2, 3 and 4 of forwarded Preface to "Sinin-ul-Islam" as expressing their views on the subject of the insuperable difficulty of adequately rendering books of pure literature. With the exception of "Geography" all the subjects contained under headings IV., V. and VI., represent "ideas and associations" rather than "things and processes". Metaphysical reasoning, social criticisms, historical judgments and books whose principal charm is their *style* cannot, without disfigurement, be translated at all. These matters are the special province of the *original* author, who, to varied and extensive reading, adds high proficiency in, and enthusiasm for, the particular subject; who is thoroughly imbued with the genius of the languages from and into which he "adapts" subjects; whose imagination is active and fertile; whose knowledge of the various developments of human thought through language is intimate, and whose diction is felicitous, because untrammelled (though, it may be, not uninfluenced) by a pattern.

These remarks do not apply with the same force to Elementary Treatises on History, and it may gratify His Excellency to know that a Treatise on Universal History (without a knowledge of which *special* History is fragmentary and unphilosophical) is being written under the auspices of the University College; and also that No. 181, "The Student's Hume", is being translated by the Educational Department. Still these attempts are watched with some anxiety by our Committee, for they have before them the marked instances of failure in the translations of the Allypore Scientific Society, especially in their rendering of Elphinstone's History of India.

I will not detain you with remarks on "a Literature for India (English and Vernacular), or with the conflicting claims of "Hindi v. Urdu", as a vehicle for European thought, although these points are connected with a correct appreciation of the question before us. It will be time to refer to these matters when the suggestion of a "graduated educational course" is accepted by Government.

In conclusion the Committee consider that to derive a practical advantage from Syad Ahmad's list it would be necessary to call for a list of all books under the various heads that *have already been translated* into the languages of this country. It is easier to translate from one "Eastern" language into another than from any European language. It may also be found that independent working in India has already anticipated the translation of some of the books in Syad Ahmad's list. At any rate, to economize and systematize intellectual labour is an undertaking of great importance, and this Committee will be very glad, if encouraged by Government, to take a part in its execution.

II.—THE THEORY OF TRANSLATION FROM ENGLISH INTO THE VERNACULAR.

Preface.

This treatise has been published for the following reasons: In July last I examined a number of Maulvis in Arabic who were candidates for Scholarships in

the Punjab University College. I found that in the Punjab, as elsewhere, whilst some of the Maulvis were profound in matters of verbal and grammatical detail to an extent and in a manner scarcely sufficiently recognized by European Orientalists, all were, more or less, ignorant of some of the most prominent facts of Arabian History and Literature. To supply somewhat this defect in their instruction I first wrote a chronological sketch of Arabian History, then another of Arabian Literature. This, however, was treating an important branch of Universal History in a somewhat fragmentary and unphilosophical manner. It no doubt was necessary to inform the Maulvis that the History of Arabia had a chronological and well ascertained sequence which did not allow them to consign it to the age of fable, however advantageous such a course might be in stimulating the sense of reverence for the distant or unknown. It was something to point out that Arabian Literature was not confined to commentaries on the Quran, to a few law treatises, erotic poems, or to grammars, but that it also embraced numerous and admirable works on mathematics, history, medicine, &c., &c. Still the main object of my sketches would have remained unfulfilled, which was to impress the Maulvi with the conviction that the history of his country, creed or literature was merely a part of the *Universal History* of human events and thoughts. I therefore became anxious to point out how Arabian History had grown into that of Muhammadanism, and how its literature had influenced the various populations professing that creed. I also endeavoured to show what place the history of Muhammadanism has in the Universal History of civilization. The result of these attempts is the present treatise.

I am fully aware that the literary value of this production is small, but its aim will be fully answered if it inspires any of the Maulvis who may read it with a wish to learn more about, and to examine critically, the great events of his own or foreign history and literature, which are here so hastily and sketchily referred to. I also hope that this treatise may induce other and more able writers to prepare books in Urdu on useful subjects on a somewhat similar plan.

I have to express my thanks for the assistance which Maulvi Muhammad Hussain has given me in the preparation of this work. It owes to him any elegance which its Urdu style may possess.

I take this opportunity of pointing out that approved books on science and literature written in any of the European languages should not be translated but "*adapted*" into Urdu. European writers, more specially perhaps those of our own times, appear to delight in generalizing and in the abstract and impersonal, whilst the genius of almost all of the "*Oriental languages*" is personal, particular, concrete and dramatic. The ordinary difficulties of translation are sufficiently great, even in the case of translation from one European language to another, to render it doubtful whether Shakespeare can be adequately translated into French, Beranger into English, or Dickens into Italian. In the case of Oriental languages the difficulties are increased to such an extent as almost to justify the assertion that most European books cannot be translated at all into them, but that they have to be *re-written*. Even in the translation of the New Testament, whose language and spirit is so very "*Eastern*", into such Oriental languages as Arabic, Turkish and Urdu, the full meaning of the original (or *our* interpretation of it, or the association which has grown up with it) is rarely rendered. As an instance I would refer to the 24th Chapter of the Gospel of St. Matthew in the Turkish version of Turabi, which, I believe, contains 108 mistakes against grammar and sense.

In Urdu we do not want translations, we want "*adaptations*". We do not, for instance, require Mill's Political Economy translated, but the *subject* of political economy introduced into Urdu in a popular form. The same view holds good with regard to history, metaphysics and literature generally, where we want the *subject* treated in a simple and idiomatic manner and not the translations of writers on these subjects.

What I venture to propose is, I believe, a more useful task than mere translation. Translations, such as have hitherto appeared, seem, as a rule, only to require a dictionary and a docile munshi; versions, so intelligible that a lad of fourteen could thoroughly understand them, require the author to know the subject on, and the language in, which he writes thoroughly. Indeed whenever words represent *thoughts*, as may be said to be the case with *literature*, it is necessary to examine the associations with which either the one or the other are connected, and, if no exact equivalent can be found in the foreign language, then the translator should himself *narrate* these associations, and, as it were, build up their history in his version—his text being a satisfactory answer to the question—"Would a Native, acquainted with the subject and desirous of teaching it in the most simple manner

to those Natives to whom it was quite new, express himself in this way?" Unless this is the adapter's practice he will teach *sounds* but not *ideas*. Of course in *scientific* terminology, whose words represent *facts* or *things*, it is practically immaterial by what combination of sounds the fact or thing is made known. Still, without some imagination and power of assimilation, no one, however great his purely linguistic attainments, can hope to write either "science" or "literature" for the native of India so as to be really understood.

No. 60.

In conclusion I venture to express a hope that this treatise may also prove of some use to those European students of the history and literature of Muhammadanism who may be acquainted with Urdu. As far as I know, no brief summary of these subjects has as yet been written in any language. I also trust that this small work will commend itself to those aspirants for "honours" in Urdu who may require a reading book in that language in addition to those already prescribed.

III.—TRANSLATION INTO HINDI.

(The Vernacular of the Punjab and the North-West Provinces which need encouragement.)

Memorandum by BABU NOBIN CHUNDER ROY, Member of the Senate, Punjab University College, addressed to the Senate to the Punjab University College,—dated Lahore, the 30th November 1870.

At a meeting of certain European members of the Senate of the Punjab University College held at Marri on the 14th September 1870 to arrange the details of founding an annual prize for treatises on natural science in the Vernacular from the "McLeod Kapurthala Fund", it was determined that Urdu should be prescribed as the "language in which the work or essay competing for the prize should be written", and it was remarked in the same meeting that the Vernacular in North India was undoubted Urdu. . . . Hindi was the Vernacular of a limited tract, and Punjabi was too unscientific a language to be the medium of conveying technical instruction. Moreover, Urdu was a language with special capabilities of assimilation, and there would be no difficulty in introducing into it terms borrowed from other languages to convey ideas for which Urdu has at present no means of expression.

I apprehend from this general opinion of the influential members of the Senate the destruction of the following fundamental principle of the Lahore University movement (now established as the Punjab University College) laid down after much discussion that "Urdu and Hindi will be the principal vehicles for *direct instruction* to the masses of the people—(see "Objects and Principles of the proposed Lahore University", p. 6, para. 8, clause II). Therefore, I feel it incumbent upon me, being one of the few members representing the Sanskrit side of the Faculty of Oriental Classics, to solicit the attention of the Senate to the necessity of adhering to the principle originally established in regard to the Vernaculars needing encouragement. I call it *necessity* for reasons into which I beg now to enter. In doing so, however, it is necessary first to define the nature of the two languages as well as the difference between them.

Hindi (Prakrit) is the primary language of the people inhabiting a large tract of the country comprising Hindustan Proper or the North-Western Provinces, Oudh, Central India, Rajputana and the Punjab. The Brjhbhāka and the Purbī dialects (to which the term "Hindi" appears to have been erroneously confined in the proceedings of the meeting held at Marri) as well as the Jaypuri, Punjabi, &c., are merely dialectic variations of Hindi (*vide* Beames's Indian Philology). Though these are actually the vernacular of the masses, they are of too rustic a character, and each of them confined to a limited tract. The common language of the whole of the North India is what is called "Hindustani", or the language of *Beitalpachisi*, *Singhasan Batisi* and *Chahar Durvesh*. It is an intermediate link between pure Hindi and Urdu, of which the former is the language of Sanskrit-knowing Pandits, and the latter of Persian-knowing Munshis and Amlas, respectively. The three languages (if they may be so called), Hindustani, Hindi (refined) and Urdu, have a proper grammar. They differ only in their words. Hindustani contains Hindi as well as Persian and Arabic words that have become familiarized. The only difference between Hindustani and Urdu is that while the former is a limited common language of the people (standing midway and having equal connection with both Hindi and Urdu), the latter is the progressing language of books, taking freely any Persian or Arabic word as may be required or desired by the writer.

Hindi, on the other hand, in the refined language of those acquainted with Sanskrit, has close affinity with Bengali, Guzrati, and several other languages of India which derive their words from Sanskrit. It contains three kinds of words, viz., pure Hindi words (derived, perhaps, from the languages of the aboriginal race), words derived from Sanskrit, differing slightly from the original words of that language, and words purely Sanskrit. This also is a progressing language of books similar to Urdu, but capable of great amplification owing to its connection with Sanskrit, which is well known to be an inexhaustible source of words, whether already existing or requiring to be coined to express new ideas and scientific terms. Thus it will be seen that Urdu and Hindi* (refined) are the languages of North India in which European scientific works can be translated and have to some extent been translated. These are, moreover, the languages recognized in the Public Instruction Department of the North-Western Provinces as vehicles of instruction in the Vernacular. They are also equally recognized by the Calcutta University, and have an equal position in the standard of examination laid down by Government for its military and staff officers.

It may be mentioned here that Urdu is, and must necessarily be, as far from being the *vernacular* of the *masses* of the people as Hindi (refined) is said to be. The reason why Urdu appears to European gentlemen to be more the vernacular than Hindi is that they hold intercourse chiefly with, and are surrounded in their official position by, the Persian-knowing Natives who speak Urdu. They seldom hold intercourse with Pandits and Natives acquainted with Sanskrit, who, however, have the real control of Hindu society. Another reason why Urdu appears so prominent to their view is that they have themselves maintained the former Muhammadan rules of the country in conducting the business of their courts and offices in that language to the great discouragement of Hindi, the natural language of the Hindus, which, nevertheless, has survived in spite of all the difficulties arising from political causes it has had constantly to contend with. But, properly speaking, Urdu can no more be considered the language of the people, because a limited number of them use it for the sake of obtaining employment in public offices, and because the converts to Islamism have made it their own, than English can be the vernacular because the babus and the employes of Government Offices and Native Christians use this language often in preference to their own vernaculars.

However, as Urdu has got a strong hold on the elite of the people, it is not improper that it should be chosen as a vehicle for the instruction of Western sciences; but I respectfully and earnestly submit that it will not meet the wants of all the classes of the people. The Calcutta University, nay all the Indian Universities, recognize the necessity of encouraging the knowledge of Sanskrit among their graduates and under-graduates, and so does our institution. Thus there will be by-an-bye an influential class of men acquainted with English and Sanskrit, in addition to the Pandits, &c., of whom a large and influential body already exists in the country (though they may not come much in contact with European officers). This class, possessing the key of the Hindu religion and social institutions from their acquaintance with Sanskrit, will naturally be and is now the leader of Hindu society. In order to reform and enlighten the nation it is very necessary to instruct these men (the Pandits, &c.) in Western sciences, and make them in time the instructors of the people over whom they have the greatest influence; but it will be as difficult for them to study sciences through Urdu as through any other foreign language, and they will hardly be able to compose or translate successfully scientific works in Urdu, as in order to do this they must be acquainted with Arabic and Persian, or at least with Urdu of a high standard which is seldom the case with those who devote themselves to the study of Sanskrit or those who choose Sanskrit as their classics in addition to English. Hence it is essentially necessary that they should have a vernacular, both for their own use and for them to use as a vehicle of instruction to the masses, in which scientific terms and words are taken from Sanskrit, instead of from Arabic and Persian, *and that vernacular is Hindi (refined).*

Taking the case in another point of view, Hindi deserves encouragement for the education of Hindu females, as Urdu can have no access within the precincts of zenanas (as far as Hindus are concerned) which is by no means less important than

* To those unacquainted with Hindi my definition of this vast language may appear contradictory. It is therefore necessary to mention here that Hindi is analytically of three kinds, or rather it has three states, viz., (1) the Hindi (Prakrit) which is the basis of all the dialects of North and Central India; (2) Hindi dialectical, such as the Brijbhāṣā, &c.; and (3) Hindi refined, which agrees in its grammar with that of Urdu, and the encouragement of which, along with Urdu, is recommended in this paper.

the instruction of males ; and when one sex receives instruction in Hindi, as is actually the case, the other sex must also cultivate that language for the purpose of mutual co-operation and help. No. 60.

Another reason for encouraging the cultivation of Hindi is that it is allied to almost all other languages of the country, *e. g.*, Bengali, Uriya, Guzerati, Punjabi, &c., which are connected with Sanskrit, and admits, therefore, of reciprocal help from those languages.

Again, Hindi is useful like Bengali, &c., as an introduction to Sanskrit, in the same way as Urdu is an introduction to Persian and Arabic for the natives of India. Experience has fully proved this fact. In Bengal the majority, nay almost all, of the graduates of the University take up Sanskrit as their second language in preference to Arabic ; while in the North-West Provinces and the Punjab the majority take up the Arabic, as they have greater chance of passing successfully in that classic of which they have studied the introductory vernacular ; Bengali being *prescribed* as the vernacular of Bengal schools, and Urdu as that of North-West Provinces and Punjab schools.

I will not tire the patience of the members with several other arguments in favour of Hindi adduced in my former papers on the subject, and read from time to time in the *Anjuman* ; nor do I advocate the cause of Hindi in supersession of Urdu as several of the learned gentlemen of Benares, Allahabad and other places in the North-Western Provinces do ; but I hope that the reasons stated above will be admitted as valid enough to give an equal place to Hindi with Urdu in our *National Institution*.

As to the idea of those who maintain that there must be one vernacular for North India receiving aid from Arabic, Persian, as well as from Sanskrit, English, &c., I cannot but say that it is quite utopian. The Englishmen who advocate this opinion make a mistake in considering the circumstances of this country analogous to those of their own, and thus applying the same rule to the languages of the former as they do to those of the latter. The case of India is quite different ; the chief inhabitants of this country are divided into two nations, the Hindus and the Muhammadans, whose classics—the Sanskrit and the Arabic, no less than their religious and social institutions—have no affinity with each other. Under this circumstance, should any attempt be made to create an artificial Vernacular (as Urdu, deriving words from *both* Arabic and Sanskrit, cannot be, even were such a course possible, anything but an artificial vernacular), there would be criterion or line of demarcation as to what extent and by what rule no such words are to be borrowed from each of these two sources. For instance, I take at random a sentence from "Lardner's Mechanics".

"The centrifugal force of a body revolving in a circle is found by multiplying its weight by the square of the velocity, or the number of feet which it moves through in a second, and dividing the product by the number of feet in the radius of the circle it described, multiplied by $32\frac{1}{2}$ ".

Which translated in Hindi would run as follows :

"Jo kisi golakor ghumti hui bastu ki kendraśarini sakti janni ho to us bastu ke bojh ko uske beg ke barg se (arthat Dhari bipal men jitne foot wah chalti ho uske barg se) guñan phal ko us rasi se bhag do jo (bhraman marg ki) paridhi ke biśārda (ke footon) ko $32\frac{1}{2}$ guna karne se hoti hai."

While the Urdu translation would be as follows :

"Agar koi shai ek daire men gardish karti ho aur uske zor mutnaaffar ul markaz ke dariaft karne ki zarurat ho to uske wazan ko uske raftar ke murabbe se (yani ek second men jitne foot wah chalti ho uske murabbe se) zarb do, aur hasil zarab ko us adad se taksim karo jo daire gardish shai mazkur ke nisf qutar ke footon ko $32\frac{1}{2}$ se zarab karne se hoti hai."

Both these translations are equally unintelligible to the masses, and neither of them can be called the vernacular of North India with more propriety than the other ; while the former would be as readily understood by one acquainted with Sanskrit, as the latter by one acquainted with Arabic and Persian. Now, if it be attempted to blend the two into one so as to make it common to the Pandit and the Maulvi, the task would obviously be impossible.

The above difficulty is not only felt by me and my countrymen who have bestowed due consideration to the subject, but also by Oriental scholars of repute amongst the Europeans. Major W. N. Lees, in his "Note on the proposal to establish an Oriental University in the Punjab", remarks as follows : "In the first place the classical languages of India do not stand in the same relation to the people here as Latin and Greek do to the people of Europe. Greek directly and through the

HOME DEPT. PROCEEDINGS, APRIL 1877.

No. 60.

Latin has an intimate connection with all the Romance languages of Europe, and there a knowledge of the history, mythology and literature of both Greece and Rome, has for centuries formed the distinguishing feature of a liberal education. The grammar and structure of both languages also, as a mental discipline, is good. Much the same may be said of Sanskrit and Arabic, with this difference that these languages belong to distinct families; they cannot be said to be homogenous; and, like the Romans, the Arabs took the Greek and not the Indian philosophers for their masters. The races, religions, languages and dialects and traditions of the people in India whose classic is Arabic are wholly distinct from those whose classic is Sanskrit; and the difficulty of merging any two languages or dialects derived respectively from them is practically exemplified in Hindustani, *which cannot be highly developed without being resolved, so to speak, into the original elements of its composition, and forming two languages—Hindi and Urdu*—so entirely foreign to each other as to become in a great measure unfit for the purposes of a common medium of communication. This is denied by a great many; but to philologists the cause which lies in the distinction of the genius of the two languages is apparent." (The italics are mine.) This corroborates my views stated above regarding the impracticability and unadvisability of prescribing Urdu alone to be the vernacular of North India, thus ignoring the claim of the Sanskritists, and with them of the Hindu nation at large.

It may be urged by some that the people themselves do not show any great predilection for Hindi: why should we, therefore, force it into them?

Firstly, this argument is based on a wrong principle, as by it the objects of the people are confused with those of our institution. The apparent predilection of the people for Urdu, and the more so for English, is with the object of gaining lucrative employment in Government Offices, while the object of our institution is not merely to make the people fitted for the posts of clerks and munshis in public offices, but to enlighten and reform them and to raise them in the scale of civilization, which can only be achieved by instilling into them a spirit of investigation and comparison of the knowledge possessed by the ancients as contained in their classical works, with the advanced knowledge of the present age contained in European scientific works, as through ignorance and prejudice they still believe the former is superior to the latter, and hence persistently cling to what they have heard traditionally in opposition to every progress and process of civilization.

Secondly, excepting those who resort to Government schools with the object of obtaining employment, the predilection of the Hindus is decidedly towards Sanskrit and Hindi or Punjabi, and of the Muhammadans towards Arabic, Persian and Urdu. Even in Government schools, if due provision were made for imparting instruction in Hindi and Sanskrit along with English as there is for imparting instruction in Urdu, Persian and Arabic, and free choice were given to the students to go through the one or the other course of study, I am sure that almost all the Hindu students would choose the former, provided no inducement or compulsion is used by the teachers in favour of the latter. This is fully borne out by the experience we have had of late in our local schools.

I must conclude now for fear of being too lengthy with a hope that the Senate will see, from what I have stated above, the necessity of adhering to the original principle of the institution, and give equal encouragement to both the Hindi and the Urdu; and that they will pass a resolution, which I beg to propose, to the effect that both in imparting instruction through the Vernacular literature they will give equal encouragement to Urdu and Hindi along with their respective classics, and that when a work is published by or under the auspices of the University College in Urdu its translations in Hindi will also be published, and *vice versa*. I need hardly mention that translations from Urdu into Hindi, or *vice versa*, are not attended with such difficulties as a translation into these languages from English, and can therefore be effected without much trouble or cost.

IV.—TRANSLATIONS INTO SANSKRIT AND PUNJABI.

(Report on a Sanskrit treatise on ancient history and on the claims of Hindi v. Urdu.)

Dated Lahore, the 15th February 1871.

From—DR. E. TRUMPP.

To—The Registrar of the Punjab University College.

In compliance with the wish of the Executive Committee of the Punjab University I beg to submit to you the following reports:

HOME DEPT. PROCEEDINGS, APRIL 1877.

1. As regards the *Sanskrit Manuscript*, I have read it over and put down its chief contents. In order that the Senate may be able to form a judgment upon its merits, I beg briefly to notice its contents. No. 60.

The 1st Chapter treats of the history of the Phœnicians and the city of Sidon and Tyre; the extent of the trade on the Phœnicians described; their skill in manufactures, especially of gold and silver ornaments; the Phœnicians, the inventors of glass, of yellow and red dyes (purple); their colonies briefly noticed.

The 2nd Chapter treats of the history of *Egypt*. First, description of the country; the inundations of the Nile; invention of agriculture; the Government of Egypt; the King restrained by laws; the priesthood learned in the hieroglyphic writing, at the same time also administrators of the realm; judicial proceedings in Egypt (with some very pertinent strictures on "hired" pleaders); their custom of embalming their dead; description of the pyramids; a short and untoward explanation of the hieroglyphic writing; the Egyptians had a knowledge of the Zodiac, and calculated the eclipse of the sun and moon; they also supposed the daily motion of the earth round its axis.

The 3rd Chapter treats of the history of Greece. Division of Greece into small States; Athens and Sparta; description of Laconia; the Dorian immigration; short story of Saturn, the Titans and Zeus; story of Kecrops, the Egyptian; Kecrops built Athens; mention of Kadmos, the Phœnician, who introduced the Phœnician alphabet into Greece; explanation of the Greek oracles and public sports; the Oracle at Delphi shortly described; the wrestling sports of Greece, chiefly those at Olympia, thence the Greek area of the Olympiads; the Greeks very intelligent, but at the same time very conceited.

The 4th Chapter treats of Athens; Theseus uniting the twelve demi-expeditions of the *Argonauts*; the siege of Troja; story of Hercules and his descendants, the *Dorians*; they seize Messene and Lakonia; siege of Athens by the Dorians; self-sacrifice of *Kodrus*; establishment of the republic at Athens; the Greek colonies to Sicily and Italy and Asia Minor.

The 5th Chapter treats of the Heraclides in *Sparta*, laws of Lycurgus, and description of the Spartan Government; valour of the Spartans, their aversion to arts and literature.

The 6th Chapter treats of Athens; the Laws of Solon; description of the Areopag Ostracismus; brief sketch of the history of Athens down to the Persian War.

The 7th Chapter treats of the history of *Media* and *Persia*; Kroesus; Cyrus; Laws and Institutions of the ancient Persians, their holy books (*Zendavesta*); brief history of the Persians down to the wars with Greece.

The work is a translation from some English outline of ancient history. The style is, on the whole, good, and not too prolix. Many mistakes have been corrected by me, which it would be too long to enumerate.

My opinion is that the little work would do good service to the Pandits if properly printed and corrected, and would therefore recommend its being printed under the superintendence of a good Pandit.

As regards the memorandum of Mr. Nobeen Chunder Roy on the use of the Hindi language in the Lahore University College, I fully agree with him that Pandits and other Hindus can only be instructed by the medium of the Hindi language. I find it daily how difficult it is to instruct a Sanskrit and Arabic class in a common subject—such as history or geography. I have nearly everything to explain in Hindi and Urdu; but I am still of opinion that in history and geography both classes, the Sanskrit and Arabic, should be taken together, not only with a view to save time, but also to bring the Hindu and Mussulman into some mutual contact with each other, which will be of great benefit to both, and tend to soften their prejudices. In all other topics both classes are respectively instructed by the medium of the Hindi or Urdu.

With regard to the Hindi, I hope the time will not be far when the Hindi of the Punjabi, i. e., the proper Punjabi, will be used as a medium of instruction; but this must be left to time. If the Punjab University will fulfil its high calling to raise up in the Punjab a number of learned Natives, and to instil into them a new ardour and zeal for learning, men will not be wanting who will cultivate the Punjabi, and use it as the proper medium of instruction for a Punjab University.

V.—SCIENTIFIC BOOKS IN ARABIC.

No. 60.

(Circulation of Dr. WARTABET'S works on Anatomy in Arabic.)

Dated Lahore, the 9th February 1871.

From—G. W. LEITNER, Esq., Registrar of the Punjab University College.

To—The Private Secretary to His Excellency the VICEROY.

IN reply to your letter dated Calcutta, the 10th ultimo, I beg to state that the same, together with its enclosures, have been considered by the Executive Committee of the Punjab University College.

2. As no meeting of the Senate is likely to take place before the 7th of next month, and we did not wish to delay matters, I venture to communicate to you (demi-officially) the views on the subject of the purchase of copies of "Dr. Wartabet's Book on Anatomy" at which we have arrived, and from which it is not very likely that the Senate will differ to any great extent.

3. Immediately on receipt of your letter I circulated the following questions among Hakims, Maulvis and "Doctors" educated under the English system :

- (1) Is there any use in circulating this book among Hakims ?
- (2) If circulated in Arabic, would Hakims pay Rs. 15 for a copy (the work will contain 800 pages and be copiously illustrated) ?
- (3) Should it be translated into Urdu, and within what time could the translation be done ?
- (4) Would it be of any use to "Native Doctors" and to students of our medical schools ?

4. To summarize the replies : It would appear that, whilst it would be of use to circulate the book among Hakims in its present form, it is very improbable that many copies could be disposed of by sale and at a higher rate than Rs. 5 per copy. An Urdu translation of the work would command a larger sale among "Native Doctors" and students of our medical schools, especially if, in the case of the latter, its study were made obligatory.

5. In this view the Committee concur. It is hopeless to expect a sale of the book at its present proposed rate of Rs. 15 per copy (30s.), especially when it is considered that books of authority among Hakims (such as the Sherá Asbab, Tibb Akbar, Qirabádin, the Kullyat, &c.) which used to be sold at Rs. 10 to Rs. 20, can scarcely command more than a third of the original price, although some of them are more than twice the bulk of Dr. Wartabet's projected work. Native Doctors, again, would find an Urdu translation of considerable use, but their salaries are so small that they could scarcely afford more than Rs. 5 per copy. When it is considered that Urdu takes up more space than Arabic, and that the translation would thus probably extend to 1,200 pages instead of 800, and, again, that a very competent translator, acquainted with anatomy, would have to be paid, seems scarcely likely, especially when one also adds the cost of "illustrations" in this country, that our Committee could sell the work at Rs. 5 or Rs. 6 per copy without considerable pecuniary loss, even if 500 copies were sold, which is very doubtful.

6. There can be no doubt that Dr. Wartabet's work is a valuable one, and it is some satisfaction to know that the Hakims to whom the specimen proofs have been sent were sufficiently enlightened to express their appreciation of it and their readiness to buy it at a reduced rate. The Committee also attach importance to an attempt to provide medical students of India with an indigenous scientific terminology *as far as such may be practicable*, and can be derived from the legitimate classical Oriental sources—Arabic and Sanskrit ;—but they do not feel themselves justified in recommending that works containing the most recent results of science should be circulated when written in a language which must confine their usefulness to a very limited number.

7. The Punjab University College have already shown their desire to promote and extend scientific medical views among the Hakims of this Province by circulating among them Vernacular medical treatises, by supporting the publication of an *Urdu Medical Gazette* by encouraging consultative meetings between Doctors and Hakims, and finally by establishing a medical Fellowship, three Vernacular medical scholarships, and regular examination in medicine. They would probably be happy to encourage the translation of Dr. Wartabet's work or the re-publication, with additions, of existing Urdu works on anatomy ; but this step beyond the compliment it confers on the author would scarcely meet the views of

HOME DEPT. PROCEEDINGS, APRIL 1877.

Dr. Wartabet. The result of his application will probably not disappoint that gentleman, for if he only expects a limited circulation of his work in a country where Arabic is spoken, he can scarcely look for any in a country where it is not spoken.

No. 60.

8. At the same time, in order to mark their appreciation of literary efforts, the Committee will be prepared to propose to the Senate to purchase a dozen copies of Dr. Wartabet's work, and will gladly undertake to sell for him any copies that he may send them on the chance of their finding a market in this Province. It is not very improbable that if copies were sent to other Provinces and to States (such as Hyderabad), where Arabic learning is honoured, that a sale would be found for them sufficiently large to reimburse Dr. Wartabet for the trouble and expense at which he must have been in compiling his useful work. It may be observed in this place that as His Highness the Maharajah of Kashmir is encouraging translations of scientific works into Sanskrit for the use of Pandits, he may be equally prepared to help the spread of medical knowledge, through the medium of Arabic, among those of his Hakims who may be acquainted with that language.

9. There is a final objection to the popularity of Dr. Wartabet's work in its present form. The natives of this Province decidedly prefer, and can read with greater ease, the "Nastaliq" character in which most of their books are lithographed, to the specifically "Arabic" character, especially as issued from the majority of European presses.

10. Trusting you will forgive the somewhat discursive character of this letter, which of course does not presume to bind the Senate to any particular action in this matter.

No. 119, dated the 9th May 1873.

No. 61.

From—J. G. CORDERY, Esq., Offg. Director of Public Instruction, Punjab.

To—The Secretary to the Government of the Punjab.

I HAVE the honour to reply to your No. 118, dated 8th January 1873, asking me for a report upon the measures I would suggest towards expediting the translation of English scientific, historical and literary works into the Vernacular languages of India.

2. It should be mentioned that experience in this Province has not been in favour of offering prizes for the production of such translations to open competition. This plan was pursued for some time; but no work was obtained by it sufficiently good to be adopted as an elementary text book either in geometry or any other subject, and many such advertisements have remained altogether unanswered. Neither English nor Native gentlemen will run the risk of losing their time and trouble.

3. The entertainment of an efficient staff paid for translation only has been much more successful. Colliers' British Empire and the Student's Hume, as well as numerous short essays, have thus been rendered into thoroughly good Urdu; and Dr. Rahim Khan is similarly attached to the Senate of the Punjab University College as a translator of medical works; but this method appears to fall short both in the low amount of prestige which it attaches to success and in the absence of any encouragement given by it to voluntary effort. It also entirely excludes the stimulus of rivalry or competition.

4. Another weak point in the system at present prevailing, which should, if possible, be avoided in any new proposal, is the want of concert between the various centres of intellectual action in the Empire. Both labour and money have thus been wasted, and there has been a want of definite aim and co-operation in exertions which are only too apt to fritter themselves away in mere debates and sectarian controversies. The object of any new scheme therefore should be to harmonize aims which at first sight appear to be somewhat incompatible with each other; to combine the stimulus of competition with a comparative certainty of reward and success if the work be well done; to produce co-operation without extinguishing emulation; and to stamp the work with the prestige of being recognized as public employ of a high character without discouraging the private enterprise in the same field.

5. These ends might perhaps be attained for the Urdu-speaking Provinces in some manner similar to the following scheme: A notification, setting forth the sum which the Government of India were prepared to grant in the way of rewards to the North-Western Provinces, Punjab and Oudh, taken together,

HOME DEPT. PROCEEDINGS, APRIL 1877.

might be published in the *Gazette*. At the same time the various literary societies and educational bodies might be publicly invited to send, through their Local Governments, a programme of what they would be prepared to undertake within the following year. The Senate of the Punjab University College, the *Anjuman* of Lahore, the Literary Society of Delhi, the Aligarh Institute, the Behar Scientific Society, and the Lucknow *Anjuman*, would undoubtedly respond. The name of each proposed translator and his qualifications for the task would be reported by the Local Governments in forwarding these lists; and they would also have the power of eliminating any proposal of which they did not approve. The Government of India in the Home Department, having compared these lists, would return them with information as to which out of two or more candidates for any one work had been preferred, and with suggestions that other works should, if possible, be undertaken by those whom they had thus excluded. At the same time they would publish the distribution of the money which had been offered as the reward fund between the different Provinces, which would of course vary each year according to the selections made from the translators and its allotment in the way of prizes to the various works upon their completion. It may be submitted on this topic that there are but few of the works in the Aligarh list the translation of which would not, if adequately performed, deserve a reward of at least Rs. 1,500.

6. The Local Governments might be directed so to curtail and limit their lists that this process should be repeated annually and a lively spirit of emulation be maintained.

7. Before the reward was given the work might be submitted to the criticisms of one of the societies of which the author was not a member. But it requires to be laid down as a canon for their guidance that though in purely scientific works fidelity to the text must necessarily be more absolute, yet in all others fidelity to the matter is the one essential, and that this ought to be and can be combined with a natural and flowing style in their own language. It is a subject of much regret, for instance, that the translation of Elphinstone's *India*, published by the Aligarh Institute, congenial as the book must have been to the mind of the author, has, in my humble opinion, been rendered so literally as to be unfit to be used as an Urdu book in our schools. Fidelity of this description is in fact indolence. Sentence by sentence, or even paragraph by paragraph, is the true method of procedure in such works, not word by word, but it of course needs more ability and occupies more time to toss about in the mind the meaning and gist of a sentence and to render it as a whole, than to advance blindly and after an almost verbatim fashion. And it is a condition of any success in popularizing English literature in Urdu that this principle should be impressed with as much authority and weight as possible upon all to whom any such work is entrusted.

8. Each of the societies that I have named could, it may be imagined, produce on an average one such work in a complete form within a year. Offers from individuals not belonging to these bodies would be accepted and considered on their merits; but the opportunity would not be lost of encouraging the formation of branch societies. Any offer of joint or associated labour also would be welcomed; for there are few productions in which the combination of English with Native labour is more likely to be of benefit than in the translations of scientific works.

NO ORDERS.

PRÉCIS.

Translation of European works into Vernacular.—Creation of Literature.

PLEASE see Office Notes and initial orders specified in the margin and placed immediately below this précis.

K. W. B. Proceedings, May 1872, Nos. 28 to 30.
Ditto ditto Dec. do. do. 22 & 23.

As directed by the Honourable Sir John Strachey in his Note of the 31st October last, letters were addressed to the Governments of Bengal, the North-Western Provinces and the Punjab, forwarding a copy of the list published by the Alighur Institute of English standard scientific works suitable for translation into the Vernacular languages for educational purposes, and calling for the opinion of those Governments as to the best mode of securing translations of such works. They were told that the Government of India would be prepared to encourage and acknowledge efforts of private individuals by the grant of pecuniary rewards and honourary distinctions, if advised so to do.

The Government of Bengal forwards copy of a report by the Director of Public Instruction, Lower Provinces, and certain other papers on the subject. Mr. Atkinson considers the Alighur Institute's list to be unnecessarily long, incomplete and badly arranged. Mr. Atkinson suggests, and the Lieutenant-Governor agrees with him, that the list of books for translation should be carefully revised in the first instance, and then the question of securing trustworthy translations should be considered separately for particular works, or classes of works, as the need for them may from time to time become apparent. He also urges the settlement of a uniform plan for dealing with scientific terms in the Vernacular languages.

Bengal No. 1326, dated 31st March 1873.

It is said that a Bengali school book when once adopted and brought on the list of the School Book Society becomes a valuable property to its author. The Lieutenant-Governor has, therefore, informed the Director of Public Instruction that as a rule no special action is needed for the encouragement of Bengali translations of school books. In Orissa there is a School Book Committee with a grant of Rs. 3,000 for procuring translations into the Uriya language; and the Lieutenant-Governor has directed the formation of similar committees in Behar and Assam in respect of Hindi and Assamese. His Honor has also ordered the preparation, for the use of the divisional committees, of a short preliminary list of some 40 elementary school books, of which good Vernacular translations are required.

The Government of the North-Western Provinces submits copies of opinions given by its Director of Public Instruction and other officers consulted on the subject. Mr. Kempson also thinks that a large portion of the books named in the Alighur Institute's list are ill-suited for translation. The Lieutenant-Governor of the North-Western Provinces is not in favour of any general scheme for translating English works into the Vernaculars, being of opinion that translations made to order prove, as a rule, failures. His Honor does not advocate the offer of rewards for the translation of any specified works, as the experiment has often been tried, and, except in a very few cases, has failed. Sir W. Muir repeats the following opinion expressed by him in a letter of December 1868—"The Lieutenant-Governor believes that a Vernacular literature must be of spontaneous growth. It cannot be created to order. To be popular it must be indigenous. The author must select his own ground, and must approach it from his own point of view; only thus is it to be expected that he will produce a work native in its dress and suitable in its modes of thought." What His Honor would recommend is

North-Western Provinces No. 379, dated 9th June 1873.

the rearing up of a class of students qualified for the task. His Honor contends that the Calcutta University fails to produce sufficient scholars of this stamp, because it insists upon too prolonged a study, and too high a standard of English, which is incompatible with high proficiency in Oriental literature; while such proficiency again is, generally speaking, indispensable for power in Vernacular authorship. In the Lieutenant-Governor's opinion the object must be sought indirectly rather than directly, and more by gradually rearing up the power and ability of Vernacular authorship than by offering money for translations: while Local Governments should at the same time be encouraged liberally to reward every successful effort made in the direction of vernacular composition, whether it be by translations, by adapted versions, or by original authorship.

The Punjab Government forwards copies of letters from Dr. Leitner, Registrar, Lahore University College, and Mr. Cordery, Director of Public Instruction in that Province. The Lieutenant-Governor retains the opinion he has long held that the best practical way of effecting the object in view is by the appointment of a committee of liberally paid translators, who would devote their whole time and attention to the subject. The system of offering prizes for the production of translations of English scientific works by open competition has proved a complete failure in that Province, and the Lieutenant-Governor is not sanguine, so far as the Punjab is concerned, that the scheme proposed by Mr. Cordery* will prove successful, as all the really good English and Urdu scholars already hold appointments under Government, and would not consequently have sufficient time to devote to the work, so that the most competent Native scholars would be practically excluded from the competition unless placed on special duty for the purpose.

Para. 5 to the end of his letter dated 9th May 1873.

P. GANGOOLY, 5-8-73.

Exd.—C. A. S.

Translation of European works into Vernacular. Creation of literature, &c.

THE Précis may be read; and some of the reports are every interesting. On the whole, however, I do not think that the papers encourage the Government of India to go further, or to add the superintendence of translations to its other multifarious functions. There is great difference of opinion as to what books should be translated; it will be recollected that Mr. Kempson's first attempt upon history has raised a gust of Muhammadan indignation. We shall only get third-rate men to do the work; and we shall get the discredit of all the mistakes made. Moreover, we shall be throwing the formation of libraries into the hands of the Educational Department, who alone will look after the business. And the educationists are not the best judges of what people want. I would adhere to the old system of patronage by subscribing liberally to any work of real merit, without attempting to stimulate in any other way the production. I think we might manage to leave this matter alone for a few years at least.

A. C. L., 4-9-73.

I SEE very little to add to what I wrote in 1867.

The only point on which any action of Government is necessary or even *useful* is the provision of school-books, both of a higher and lower character, to meet the earlier demands of vernacular teaching. The existence of these is necessary for any teaching, but at *first* private enterprise will not provide them. To this extent Government action is requisite, although I am quite prepared to admit that such school-books will, as a rule, be inferior to those prepared by Native scholars in their own vernacular, and prepared also with a view to suit Native idiosyncrasies. When these come, by all means let them supersede those prepared by Government, provided they are sufficiently good. Meanwhile, there is no harm in encouraging by pecuniary rewards, by paying the expense of printing, and by honorary distinctions, the publication by private individuals of works suited for Natives, whether they are written for scholastic or for general literary purposes; but books of this latter class will only come when there is a demand for them. It is the province of Government to create by education not the supply, but the demand. In Bengal, as I have said, little is wanted; but some such society as that for the diffusion of useful knowledge in England would be, I have no doubt, capable of doing a great deal of good, and Government might, by purchasing books or by honorary distinctions even in Bengal, do *something* to help.

E. C. B., 5-9-73.

To His Excellency the Viceroy.—A. C. L., 13-9-73.

PROBABLY it will be desirable to wait the reports of the Committees now sitting to review the class books used in Government schools before doing anything more in the direction of translations.

N., 15-9-73.

HONOURABLE Member to see. No orders.

A. C. L., 15-9-73.

E. C. B., 16-9-73.

NOTE to put up hereafter.—A. C. L., 16-9-73.

Exd.—N. C. D.

EDUCATION.

PROCEEDINGS—APRIL.

Nos. 53 to 61.

Translation of European works into Vernacular languages
of India for the purposes of Education.

LIST OF PAPERS.

No. 53. From the Government of Bengal No. 1326, dated 31st March 1873, submitting copy of correspondence on the subject of the translation of English standard books into the vernacular language of India for the purposes of education.

Nos. 54 to 56. Enclosures.

No. 57. From the Government of the North-Western Provinces No. 379 A, dated 9th June 1873, forwarding copy of a letter from the Director of Public Instruction in those Provinces and enclosures containing the opinions of certain officers who have been consulted on the subject of the translation of English standard works into the vernacular languages for educational purposes.

No. 58. Enclosure.

No. 59. From the Government of the Punjab No. 2690, dated 12th July 1873, forwarding correspondence and conveying remarks as to the best mode of obtaining good vernacular translations of English Scientific Works.

Nos. 60 & 61. Enclosures.

REFERENCE TO FORMER CASES.

Progs., April 1877, Nos. 21 to 52.

Exd.—D. N. M.